



Minutes

Name of meeting	FULL COUNCIL
Date and time	WEDNESDAY, 30 SEPTEMBER 2009 COMMENCING AT 6.00 PM
Venue	COUNCIL CHAMBER, COUNTY HALL, NEWPORT, ISLE OF WIGHT
Present	Cllrs Arthur Taylor (Chairman), Barry Abraham, Jonathan Bacon, Reg Barry, Peter Bingham, George Brown, Ivan Bulwer, George Cameron, Vanessa Churchman, Dawn Cousins, Roger Dixcey, Rodney Downer, Stuart Dyer, Paul Fuller, Edward Giles, John Hobart, John Howe, Heather Humby, Tim Hunter-Henderson, Julie Jones-Evans, Patrick Joyce, David Knowles, Geoff Lumley, Roger Mazillius, David Pugh, Colin Richards, Susan Scoccia, Ian Stephens, Andy Sutton, Ian Ward, Margaret Webster, Chris Welsford, Jerry White, Wayne Whittle, Adrian Whittaker, David Whittaker, David Williams, William Wyatt-Millington
Apologies	Cllrs Richard Hollis, Lora Peacey-Wilcox

The Chairman advised Council that the meeting would be extended to 10.00 pm with a review being taken at that time as to whether a further extension would be necessary. The meeting would be adjourned for a short break at approximately 8.00 pm.

20. Minutes

RESOLVED :

THAT the Minutes of the meeting held on [29 July 2009](#) be confirmed.

21. Declarations of Interest

The following declarations of interest were received:

Member	Agenda Item	Interest	Nature of Interest
Cllr Taylor	6	Personal	LEA Governor of Greenmount Primary School and family members in the education system and associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid.

Member	Agenda Item	Interest	Nature of Interest
Cllr Peacey-Wilcox	6	Personal	Family members in the education system and associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid.
Cllr Bacon	6	Personal	Family members and children of close associates in the education system. Associates who work in the school system. Wife is a governor at St Helens Primary School and Cllr Bacon also undertakes some voluntary work at St Helens Primary School.
Cllr Williams	6	Personal	Governor at Gatten & Lake Primary and Sandham Middle schools and associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid.
Cllr Lumley	6	Personal	Governor at Downside Middle School.
Cllr Downer	6	Personal	Family member works at a school not being decided upon tonight.
Cllr Mazillius	6	Personal	Governor at Love Lane and Northwood Primary schools and Cowes High School. Has a family member who supplies architectural and other services to the IW Council and associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid.
Cllr Howe	6	Personal	Governor at Weston Primary, St Saviours RC and West Wight Middle schools. Family member Governor at Carisbrooke High School. Trustee of West Wight Nursery.
Cllr Jones-Evans	6	Personal	Has a family member in the education system and associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid.
		Personal and Prejudicial in as far as it affects Nodehill Middle School	Has a family member who works at Nodehill Middle School

Member	Agenda Item	Interest	Nature of Interest
Cllr Richards	6	Personal Personal and Prejudicial in as far as it affects Newport C of E primary	Governor at Newchurch Primary school and family members in the education system. Has a family member who works at Newport C of E primary school.
Cllr Dixcey	6	Personal and Prejudicial in as far as it affects Newport C of E primary school Personal	Has a family member who works at Newport C of E Primary school . Family who are in the education system and associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid.
Cllr Webster	6	Personal and Prejudicial in as far as it relates to the decisions on the schools in the East Cowes and East Wight areas, the EWO Community School Group, and Brading CE VC Primary School. Personal interest	As a named member of the EWO Community School Group and as have family members working in schools in these areas. As have family members in the education system.
Cllr Dyer	6	Personal interest	Governor of Yarmouth CE Primary School and has family members in the education system.
Cllr Abraham	6	Personal	Associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid and also a family member in the education system and Governor of Wootton Primary School.
Cllr Bingham	6	Personal	Associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid.

Member	Agenda Item	Interest	Nature of Interest
Cllr Brown	6	Personal	Associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid.
Cllr Bulwer	6	Personal	Associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid and Governor of Binstead Primary School.
Cllr Cameron	6	Personal	Associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid.
Cllr Cousins	6	Personal	Associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid.
Cllr Giles	6	Personal	Associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid.
Cllr Hobart	6	Personal	Associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid and Governor of Gurnard Primary School.
Cllr Hunter-Henderson	6	Personal	Associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid.
Cllr Pugh	6	Personal	Associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid.
Cllr Scoccia	6	Personal	Associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid.
Cllr Sutton	6	Personal	Associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid and family member in the education system.
Cllr Ward	6	Personal	Associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid.
Cllr White	6	Personal	Associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid.
Cllr D Whittaker	6	Personal	Associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid and family members in the education system.
Cllr Wyatt-Millington	6	Personal	Associate of 2 members of the EWO Community School Group bid and Governor of Chale CE VC Primary School and Niton Primary School.

Member	Agenda Item	Interest	Nature of Interest
Cllr Fuller	6	Personal	Family members in the education system and Standards not Tiers endorsed candidature are election. Also Governor of Northwood Primary School and prospective Governor of Cowes High School.
Cllr Joyce	6	Personal	Family members in the education system and is a director of a company that undertakes work for the council.
Cllr Welsford	6	Personal	As a member of "Standards not Tiers" and has family members in the education system.
Cllr Knowles	6	Personal	As nominated to be a Governor of Bishop Lovett middle school.
Cllr Humby	6	Personal	As a Governor of Sandown High and Sandham Middle and Sandown St Johns.
Cllr Churchman	6	Personal	As a Governor of St Boniface CE VC Primary School.
Cllr Barry	6	Personal	As a Governor of Ryde High School and prospective Governor of Bishop Lovett Middle School and family members in the education system.
Cllr A Whittaker	6	Personal	Family members in the education system.

22. Public Question Time

Written questions had been received as follows:

Name:	Subject:	Reference Number:
Mrs T Rowney	Council representation at user group meetings.	PQ 18/09
Mr David Miller	The options for decision on Schools Organisation and the possible involvement of the Schools' Adjudicator.	PQ 19/09
Mr David Breach	Whether the new-build for Ventnor Primary School depended upon a single two-form entry school for Ventnor.	PQ 20/09

Oral questions were put to the Chairman as follows:

Name:	Subject:	Comment
Mr Mike Starke	The extent of the support from Portsmouth Diocese for the proposals for Chale CE VC Primary School.	The Leader provided a response.

23. **Chairman's Report**

The Chairman had circulated a written report for information.

24. **Motion submitted under procedure rule 10**

Cllr Lumley suggested that his motion be debated after item 6 on the agenda, if time allowed. This was seconded and accepted by the Chairman.

25. **School Organisation – Decision on the Statutory and Competition Notices**

The Chairman advised Council that the Leader would be allowed up to 30 minutes and Group Leaders, or their representatives, up to 15 minutes for introductory speeches.

The Leader provided a brief background to the report, reminding Members that the first consultation, ending in February 2008, had looked at options to improve the standard of education on the Island and results had indicated significant support for a move to a primary/secondary system of school organisation. Full Council further debated options put forward on 19 March 2008 and following the Councils recommendations the Cabinet agreed that officers undertake a review of the outcomes for each school if there was a change from a primary, middle and high school age range to a primary and secondary age range system.

After further consultation and a comparison with the requirements of the Education and Inspection Act 2006, Cabinet debated the results and approved the statutory consultation on the move from a primary, middle, high school to a primary, secondary school age range. The future of each school had been further debated by Cabinet on 24 November 2008.

The results of the first statutory competition notices, involving the proposed five new high schools and two new primary schools closed on 20 June 2009. The second statutory notices were published on 10 July 2009 for the same schools, but also included the Church of England and Roman Catholic Diocesan authorities and in some cases school governing bodies. These Notices provided for the closure, establishment and expansion for all main stream schools, with the exception of learning difficulty special schools, which were outside of the proposed reorganisation.

This debate represented the final step for the future of the Island's schools. Proposals received from local communities and parish councils had been taken into account and Members were asked to focus on providing better opportunities for young people.

Attention was drawn to appendix D which stated what would be expected from future providers and appendix E which detailed an evaluation of the bids. The Leader also advised that funding to support the reorganisation was secured.

Cllr Welsford spoke on behalf of the Independent Group raising concerns about responses to queries regarding the Statutory Notices for Closure. Particular concerns were put forward regarding the closure of Chale CE VC Primary School and future educational choice for parents and children in Ventnor. Additional funding and future costs for transport required to support the recommendations gave rise to further concern. Council was also advised that some mainland educational reorganisation schemes had been unsuccessful.

Cllr Barry, stated that the proposed two-tier system was supported by the group. However, concerns were raised about potential time limits for funding available and a perceived devolvement of control to unelected bodies.

Further comment received during the discussion included concerns about the delays to date and the resulting uncertainty already experienced by the Island's children; confidence in the Education Inspection Act, and retaining control for decision-making on the Island.

Revised recommendations had been circulated prior to the meeting and were also shown on the presentation screen for additional clarity. The Leader advised that a separate vote would be required for each Island school regarding the statutory notices and the award for each second statutory competition notice due to objections being submitted for every Island school.

In accordance with procedure rule 17(5) four Members requested named votes for each of the five secondary schools competition awards; the statutory notices for the closure of Chale CE VC Primary School; St Boniface CE VC Primary School; St Margaret's CE VC Primary School; St Wilfrid's Catholic VA Primary School and the new CE/Catholic VA Ventnor Primary School.

During the debate concerns were expressed about the quality of the consultation process and the timing of meetings with potential competition bidders.

Following debate and consideration, each motion was duly moved and seconded and it was:

RECCOMENDED TO CABINET :

- (i) THAT that there has been sufficient and appropriate consultation in respect of school re-organisation and that the Local Authority, as decision-maker, should proceed to determine the approval, modification, rejection or withdrawal of the statutory proposals in respect of each school and the award of the competition in respect of each school competition.
- (ii) THAT in respect of the approval, modification, rejection or withdrawal of each statutory proposal for the closure, establishment, expansion or other prescribed alteration of a school as set out below. That Cabinet be recommended in respect of the award of each school competition as set out below.

NEWPORT AREA

(During the consideration of the schools in the Newport Area, Cllr Jones-Evans, having declared a personal and prejudicial interest, left the room.)

1. Downside Middle School (Furrlongs and Kitbridge campuses):

During the debate concerns were raised about the closure of the school in view of the proposed Pan development and continued use of the site. Following the vote it was

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

2. Nodehill Middle School

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

3. Carisbrooke High School

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

4. Medina High School

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

5. Newport (Carisbrooke) Secondary School

During the debate Members noted that the school would serve the whole of the West Wight area. Support was indicated for an opportunity for better student outcomes under an Island Trust. Further discussions would be held at the due diligence stage as to how the federation would work in practice.

The result of the named vote was as follows:

For: Cllrs Stephens, Taylor, Pugh, Abraham, Bingham, Brown, Bulwer, Cameron, Cousins, Dixcey, Giles, Hobart, Hunter-Henderson, Mazillius, Scoccia, Sutton, Ward, Webster, White, Whittaker (D), Williams, Wyatt-Millington, Lumley, Barry, Howe, Knowles, Richards, Whittaker (A) Bacon, Churchman, Downer, Dyer, Fuller, Humby, Joyce, Welsford, Whittle.

Against: None

Abstentions: None

RESOLVED:

- (a) THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the award of the competition to establish a new secondary school.
- (b) THAT Cabinet be recommended to award the competition for the school to Medina Innovation Trust (MIT) as a Foundation/Trust school (in a federation with Newport (Fairlee) Secondary School).

6. Newport Fairlee Secondary School

The result of the named vote was as follows:

For: Cllrs Stephens, Taylor, Pugh, Abraham, Bingham, Brown, Bulwer, Cameron, Cousins, Dixcey, Giles, Hobart, Hunter-Henderson, Mazillius, Scoccia, Sutton, Ward, Webster, White, Whittaker (D), Williams, Wyatt-Millington, Lumley, Barry, Howe, Knowles, Richards, Whittaker (A) Bacon, Churchman, Downer, Dyer, Fuller, Humby, Joyce, Welsford, Whittle. (37)

Against: None

Abstentions: None

RESOLVED:

- (a) THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the award of the competition to establish a new secondary school.
- (b) THAT Cabinet be recommended to award the competition for the school to Medina Innovation Trust (MIT) as a Foundation/Trust school (in a federation with Newport (Carisbrooke) Secondary School).

7. Arreton St George's CE VC Primary School

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school and enlarge the school (in a federation with Oakfield CE VA Primary School).

8. Barton Primary School

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school.

9. Carisbrooke CE VC Primary School

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school and enlarge the school.

10. Hunnyhill Primary School

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school and enlarge the school.

11. Newport CE VA Primary School

(During the consideration of this item Cllrs Dixcey and Richards having declared a personal and prejudicial item left the room)

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school and enlarge the school.

12. Nine Acres Primary School

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school.

13. St Thomas of Canterbury Catholic VA Primary School

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school and enlarge the school (in a federation with St Mary's Catholic VA Primary School).

14. Summerfields Primary School

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school.

The Chairman adjourned the meeting for a short break at 8.20 pm.

The meeting reconvened at 8.35 pm when the Leader continued to propose the recommendations for schools.

COWES AREA

15. Solent Middle School

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

16. Somerton Middle School

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

17. Cowes High School

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

18. Cowes Secondary School

During the debate it was noted that the school had attained the highest percentage increase in GCSE results this year and that the Cowes Pathfinder Partnership was the best fit to the specification for the school.

The result of the named vote was as follows:

For: Cllrs Stephens, Taylor, Pugh, Abraham, Bingham, Brown, Bulwer, Cameron, Cousins, Dixcey, Giles, Hobart, Hunter-Henderson, Jones-Evans, Mazillius, Scoccia, Sutton, Ward, Webster, White, Whittaker (D), Williams, Wyatt-Millington, Lumley, Barry, Howe, Knowles, Richards, Whittaker (A) Bacon, Churchman, Downer, Dyer, Fuller, Humby, Joyce, Welsford, Whittle. (38)

Against; None

Abstentions: None

RESOLVED:

(a) THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the award of the competition to establish a new secondary school.

(b) THAT Cabinet be recommended to award the competition for the school to Cowes Pathfinder Partnership (CPP) as a Foundation/Trust School.

19. Cowes Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school and enlarge the school.

20. Gurnard Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school, enlarge the school and increase the admission number of the school.

21. Love Lane Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school and enlarge the school.

22. Northwood Primary School:

The Local Member, Cllr Mazillius, spoke in support of the proposal.

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school.

EAST COWES AREA

(During consideration of the schools in the East Cowes Area, Cllr Webster, having declared a personal and prejudicial interest, left the room.)

23. Osborne Middle School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

24. East Cowes Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

25. Whippingham Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

26. New East Cowes Primary School:

The Local Member, Cllr Giles, spoke in support of the proposal.

RESOLVED:

- (a) THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the award of the competition to establish a new primary school.
- (b) THAT Cabinet be recommended to award the competition for the school to EWO Community School Group (EWOCSSG) as a Foundation/Trust school.

27. Holy Cross Catholic VA Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school and enlarge the school.

RYDE AREA

28. Bishop Lovett CE VC Middle School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

29. Mayfield Middle School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

30. Swanmore Middle School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

31. Ryde High School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

32. Ryde Secondary School:

The Leader advised that concerns had been raised about control of the school not being democratically accountable and the availability of funding. However, it was envisaged that the Academy would be well-placed to develop the discussions with the DCSF in order to support an improvement in standards and build on the existing strengths of the school.

During the debate Cllr Lumley raised concerns about future funding for academies in the event of a change of government and a lack of commitment to the Island by awarding to a mainland provider. Cllr Lumley moved an amendment to the second part of the proposal, which was seconded:

That Cabinet be recommended to award the competition for the school to East Wight Educational Trust (EWET) as a Foundation/Trust school.

The Leader spoke to the amendment and a named vote was taken as follows:

For: Cllrs Lumley, Barry, Howe, Knowles, Richards. (5)

Against: Cllrs Stephens, Taylor, Pugh, Abraham, Bingham, Brown Bulwer, Cameron, Cousins, Dixcey, Giles, Hobart, Hunter-Henderson, Jones-Evans, Mazillius, Scoccia, Sutton, Ward, Webster, White, Whittaker (D), Williams, Wyatt-Millington, Bacon, Churchman, Downer, Dyer, Fuller, Humby, Whittle. (30)

Abstentions: Cllr Welsford. (1)

The amendment was lost.

The debate returned to the substantive motion and the Local Member, Cllr Stephens, spoke in support of the proposal. The result of the named vote was as follows:

For: Cllrs Stephens, Taylor, Pugh, Abraham, Bingham, Brown, Bulwer, Cameron, Cousins, Dixcey, Giles, Hobart, Hunter-Henderson, Jones-Evans, Mazillius, Scoccia, Sutton, Ward, Webster, White, Whittaker (D), Williams, Wyatt-Millington, Bacon, Churchman, Downer, Dyer, Humby, Welsford, Whittle. (30)

Against: Cllrs Lumley, Barry, Howe, Richards. (4)

Abstentions: Cllr Joyce. (1)

RESOLVED:

- (a) THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the award of the competition to establish a new secondary school.
- (b) THAT Cabinet be recommended to award the competition for the school to Academies Enterprise Trust (AET) as an Academy.

33. Binstead Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school.

34. Dover Park Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school.

35. Haylands Primary School:

During the debate the Local Member spoke in support of the motion. Following the vote it was

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school and enlarge the school.

36. Greenmount Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school, enlarge the school and increase the admission number of the school.

37. Oakfield CE VA Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school (in federation with Arreton CE VC Primary School).

38. St Mary's Catholic VA Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school and enlarge the school (in a federation with St Thomas of Canterbury Catholic VA Primary School).

39. Wootton Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school and enlarge the school.

EAST WIGHT AREA

(During consideration of the schools in the East Wight Area, Cllr Webster, having declared a personal and prejudicial interest, left the room.)

40. Forelands Middle School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

41. Bembridge CE VC Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school and enlarge the school.

42. Nettlestone Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school and enlarge the school.

SANDOWN/SHANKLIN AREA

43. Lake Middle School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

44. Sandham Middle School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

45. Sandown High School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school>

The Chairman invited Members to consider a further extension of the meeting, and received majority agreement to extend the meeting in order to conclude the debate and voting for each Island school.

46. Sandown Secondary School:

The Leader advised Members that concerns had been raised about recent examination results and the financial management of the school. The Academy model would be the best provider to address a sustainable future for the school and the best opportunity for funding a re-build.

During the debate an amendment was moved by Cllr Lumley:

That Cabinet be recommended to award the competition for the school to East Wight Educational Trust (EWET) as a Foundation/Trust school.

The amendment was seconded and the result of the named vote was as follows:

For: Cllrs Lumley, Barry, Howe, Richards. (4)

Against: Cllrs Stephens, Taylor, Pugh, Abraham, Bingham, Brown, Bulwer, Cameron, Cousins, Dixcey, Giles, Hobart, Hunter-Henderson, Jones-Evans, Mazillius, Scoccia, Sutton, Ward, Webster, White, Whittaker (D), Williams, Wyatt-Millington, Bacon, Downer, Dyer, Fuller, Humby, Whittle. (29)

Abstentions: Cllrs Churchman, Joyce, Welsford. (3)

The amendment was lost.

The debate returned to the substantive motion and following the vote it was

RESOLVED:

- (a) THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the award of the competition to establish a new secondary school.
- (b) THAT Cabinet be recommended to award the competition for the school to Academies Enterprise Trust (AET) as an Academy.

47. Sandown CE VC Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

48. St John's CE VC Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

49. Sandown /St John's Amalgamated Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to establish a new Church of England Voluntary Controlled school.

50. Broadlea Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school and enlarge the school.

51. Gatten and Lake Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school.

52. Newchurch Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school.

53. Shanklin CE VC Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school.

VENTNOR /SOUTH WIGHT AREA

54. Ventnor Middle School:

During the debate the Local Member, Cllr Welsford, spoke against the motion, stating that the proposal would not enhance the community or address the levels of deprivation in the area.

RESOLVED:

THAT recommendation be made to Cabinet to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

55. Chale CE VC Primary School:

The Leader moved the proposal, as previously circulated:

That Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

Council was advised that appropriate government guidance had been followed, sufficient consultation had been undertaken and the case to close the school was strong enough to overcome the national presumption to retain rural schools wherever possible.

The motion was seconded and during the debate an amendment was moved by the Local Member, Cllr Wyatt-Millington:

That recommendation be made to Cabinet that the closure notice for Chale School be withdrawn to allow time to explore federated status in principle, or other options.

Cllr Wyatt-Millington explained that the Chale community had raised concerns about home to school transport issues and a perceived change of views from the Portsmouth Diocese about the future of the school.

The result of the named vote on the amendment was as follows:

For: Cllrs Stephens, Wyatt-Millington, Barry, Howe, Bacon, Churchman, Downer, Dyer, Fuller, Humby, Joyce, Welsford, Whittle. (13)

Against: Cllrs Taylor, Pugh, Abraham, Bingham, Brown, Bulwer, Cameron, Cousins, Dixcey, Giles, Hobart, Hunter-Henderson, Jones-Evans, Mazillius, Scoccia, Sutton, Ward, Webster, White, Whittaker (D), Williams, Lumley. (22)

Abstentions: None

The amendment was lost.

In the light of the previous discussion the Leader proposed an alternative motion for debate to replace the substantive motion, which was accepted by the seconder. The results of the named vote were as follows:

For: Cllrs Stephens, Taylor, Pugh, Abraham, Brown, Bulwer, Cameron, Cousins, Dixcey, Giles, Hobart, Hunter-Henderson, Jones-Evans, Mazillius, Scoccia, Sutton, Ward, Webster, White, Whittaker (D), Williams, Wyatt-Millington, Lumley, Barry, Howe, Bacon, Churchman, Downer, Dyer, Fuller, Humby, Joyce, Welsford, Whittle. (34)

Against: None

Abstentions: Cllr Bingham. (1)

RESOLVED:

THAT recommendation be made to Cabinet to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue Chale CE VC Primary School with the undertaking that if a federation proposal is put forward within two months of the Cabinet decision, a Cabinet Member delegated decision would be made forthwith to determine whether such a proposed federation was viable and in line with Council policy, and if so that revocation proposals would be published without delay.

56. St Boniface CE VC Primary School:

The Leader proposed the motion, informing Members that closure of the small church schools to be replaced by a joint faith school in Ventnor would support the primary/high school model whilst retaining local provision.

During the debate the Local Member, Cllr Welsford, raised concerns about the sustainability of the transport plans and perceived inaccuracies in the submission to the Secretary of State.

The result of the named vote was as follows:

For: Cllrs Taylor, Pugh, Abraham, Bingham, Brown, Bulwer, Cameron, Cousins, Dixcey, Giles, Hobart, Hunter-Henderson, Jones-Evans, Mazillius, Scoccia, Sutton, Ward, Webster, White, Whittaker (D), Williams, Wyatt-Millington, Barry, Howe. (24)

Against: Cllrs Stephens, Lumley, Bacon, Churchman, Downer, Fuller, Humby, Joyce, Welsford, Whittle. (10)

Abstentions: Cllr Dyer. (1)

RESOLVED:

THAT recommendation be made to Cabinet to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

A further extension of the meeting was proposed and Members agreed to continue in order to enable the debate and voting on the Island's schools to be concluded.

57. St Margaret's CE VC Primary School:

The result of the named vote was as follows:

For: Cllrs Taylor, Pugh, Bingham, Brown, Bulwer, Cameron, Cousins, Giles, Hobart, Hunter-Henderson, Jones-Evans, Mazillius, Scoccia, Sutton, Ward, Webster, White, Whittaker (D), Williams, Wyatt-Millington, Barry, Howe. (22)

Against: Cllrs Stephens, Lumley, Bacon, Churchman, Downer, Fuller, Humby, Joyce, Welsford, Whittle. (10)

Abstentions: Cllrs Dixcey, Dyer. (2)

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

58. St Wilfrid's Catholic VA Ventnor Primary School:

The result of the named vote was as follows:

For: Cllrs Taylor, Pugh, Abraham, Bingham, Brown, Bulwer, Cameron, Cousins, Dixcey, Giles, Hobart, Hunter-Henderson, Jones-Evans, Mazillius, Scoccia, Sutton, Ward, Webster, White, Whittaker (D), Williams, Wyatt-Millington, Barry, Howe. (24)

Against: Cllrs Stephens, Lumley, Bacon, Churchman, Downer, Humby, Joyce, Welsford, Whittle. (9)

Abstentions: Cllr Dyer. (1)

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

59. New CE/Catholic VA Ventnor Primary School:

During the debate an amendment was moved by the Local Member, Cllr Welsford:

That recommendation be made to Cabinet to withdraw the statutory notice, re-consult the community and publish a new notice for a CE/RC VA primary school of one form entry in Lower Ventnor and a one form entry community primary school in Upper Ventnor. The community school would have to be let by competition.

Following further debate, the result of the named vote was as follows:

For: Cllrs Stephens, Wyatt-Millington, Lumley, Barry, Bacon, Fuller, Humby, Joyce, Welsford, Whittle (10)

Against: Cllrs Taylor, Pugh, Abraham, Bingham, Brown, Bulwer, Cameron, Cousins, Dixcey, Giles, Hobart, Hunter-Henderson, Jones-Evans, Mazillius, Scoccia, Sutton, Ward, Webster, White, Whittaker (D), Williams. (21)

Abstentions: Cllr Dyer. (1)

The amendment was lost.

The debate returned to the substantive motion during which the Local Member, Cllr Scoccia spoke in support of the proposed new-build, joint faith school drawing attention to the investment in Ventnor and the benefits for local children. Following further discussion, the result of the named vote was as follows:

For: Cllrs Taylor, Pugh, Abraham, Bingham, Brown, Bulwer, Cameron, Cousins, Dixcey, Giles, Hobart, Hunter-Henderson, Jones-Evans, Mazillius, Scoccia, Sutton, Ward, Webster, White, Whittaker (D), Williams, Wyatt-Millington. (22)

Against: Cllrs Lumley, Bacon, Fuller, Welsford, Whittle. (5)

Abstentions: Cllrs Stephens, Barry, Howe, Dyer. (4)

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to establish a new Voluntary Aided Catholic and Church of England primary school.

60. Niton Primary School:

During the debate concerns were raised about access to the school. Following the vote it was

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school and enlarge the school.

WEST WIGHT AREA

61. West Wight Middle School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to discontinue the school.

62. All Saints CE VC Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school and enlarge the school.

63. Brighstone CE VA Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school and enlarge the school.

64. St Saviour's Catholic VA Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school and enlarge the school.

65. Weston Primary School:

RESOLVED:

THAT Cabinet be recommended to approve and implement the statutory proposal to increase the upper age limit of the school and enlarge the school.

The Leader proposed the recommendation as set out at paragraph 96 of the report. Following the vote it was

RESOLVED:

- (iii) THAT on the award of any secondary school with Academy status that Cabinet be recommended that the statutory proposals to establish new secondary schools are modified to show the opening date of each school to be the 1 September 2011 rather than the published date of 1 September 2010. If this recommendation is made the statutory proposals to discontinue each High School must also be modified to show a date for closure of 31 August 2011 rather than the published date of 31 August 2010.

The Leader moved the recommendation set out at paragraph 97 of the report and explained that this referred to the independent panel that made recommendations to the original proposals. Further statutory notices would need to be published to avoid schools being disadvantaged by being excluded from the current admissions process.

Members sought assurance that an open forum decision could be made if problems were experienced and this was given.

Following the vote it was

RESOLVED:

- (iv) THAT Cabinet be recommended to proceed, subject to statutory consultation, with the publication of the statutory notices to increase the upper age limit from 9 years of age to 11 years of age for Brading CE VC Primary School, St Helens Primary School, Shalfleet CE VC Primary School and Yarmouth CE VA Primary School. Following the statutory representation period and due consideration of any representation received it is also recommended to Cabinet that the decision to approve, modify, reject or withdraw these four statutory notices is made by delegated decision.

The Leader proposed the recommendation as set out at paragraph 98 of the report and during the debate concerns were raised regarding the source of the funds and the long-term projection of costs. Council was advised that adjustments could be made with the council's administration to meet some of the cost, but additional costs would need to be addressed in future discussions around home to school transport.

Following the vote it was

RESOLVED:

- (v) THAT it be recommended to Cabinet that the additional £400,000 of funding to meet the annual costs of a closed primary home to school lift is provided. The funding to be achieved by the re-direction of budget resources released within the Directorate of Children and Young People by service re-structuring to meet the needs of the new school system.

The Leader proposed the recommendation as set out in paragraph 99 of the report relating to the appointment of governors in primary schools.

Following the vote it was

RESOLVED:

- (vi) THAT it be recommended to Cabinet that all Local Authority governors in primary schools are made as new appointments on the decision to implement the new school system.

The Leader thanked all Members, members of the press and officers for their perseverance throughout the meeting.

The Chairman advised, with the agreement of Cllrs Lumley and Pugh, that items 5 and 7 on the agenda would be deferred to the next Council meeting. Members were also advised to take Cabinet Reports* as circulated taking up any specific issues with Cabinet Members outside of the meeting.

CHAIRMAN

*Cabinet Reports may be accessed below:-

[The Leader and Cabinet Member for Governance and School Improvement](#)

[The Deputy Leader and Cabinet Member for the Economy, Tourism, Leisure and Planning](#)

**[Cabinet Member for Children, Social Care, Health and Housing - Community Services
- Children's Services](#)**

[Cabinet Member for the Environment and Transport](#)

[Cabinet Member for Fire and Community Safety](#)

[Cabinet Member for Major Projects, Customer Service and Communications](#)

[Cabinet Member for Resources](#)

[Chair of Overview and Scrutiny](#)