



# Minutes

Name of meeting	<b>PLANNING SUB COMMITTEE</b>
Date and time	<b>TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2013 COMMENCING AT 4.00 PM</b>
Venue	<b>COUNCIL CHAMBER, COUNTY HALL, NEWPORT, ISLE OF WIGHT</b>
Present	Cllrs Richard Hollis (Chairman), Reg Barry, George Cameron, Vanessa Churchman, Paul Fuller, John Hobart, Julie Jones-Evans, Susan Scoccia, Arthur Taylor, David Williams
Also Present (non voting)	Cllrs George Brown, Margaret Webster
Officers Present	Jean Chambers, Mike Gildersleeves, Bill Murphy, Phil Salmon, Justin Thorne, Alan White, Andrew White, Simon Wiggins, Stephen Wiltshire

---

40. [Minutes](#)

RESOLVED :

THAT the Minutes of the meeting held on [22 January 2013](#) be confirmed.

41. [Declarations of Interest](#)

Cllr Julie Jones-Evans declared a personal interest in Minute 42 (2) – 76 Worsley Road, Cowes, Isle of Wight, as she knew the applicant.

Cllr Susan Scoccia declared a personal and pecuniary interest in Minute 42 (7) – Tesco Stores Ltd, Brading Road, Ryde, Isle of Wight, as her company was a supplier to Tesco. She was not present during the discussion or voting thereon.

## 42. Report of the Head of Planning and Regulatory Services

### Planning Applications and Related Matters

Consideration was given to items 1 - 7 of the report of the Head of Planning and Regulatory Services.

#### RESOLVED :

THAT the applications be determined as detailed below :

The reasons for the resolutions made in accordance with Officer recommendation were given in the Planning report. Where resolutions are made contrary to Officer recommendation the reasons for doing so are contained in the minutes.

A schedule of additional representations received after the printing of the report were submitted at the beginning of the meeting and were drawn to the attention of Members when considering the application. A note is made to that effect in the minutes.

<b>Application:</b>	<a href="#">TCP/30862/A</a>
<b>Details:</b>	Demolition of dwelling; proposed dwelling; alterations to vehicular access and provision of parking area (revised scheme). 76 Worsley Road, Cowes, Isle of Wight.
<b>Site Visits:</b>	The site was visited by the Planning Sub Committee members on Friday, 15 February 2013.
<b>Public Participants:</b>	Lisa Anderson (Objector) Ben Hollis (Objector) Angie Silcox (Objector) Cllr Richard Day (Gurnard Parish Council) Mrs Brocklehurst (Applicant) Mr Townsend (Applicant)
<b>Additional Representations:</b>	None.
<b>Comment:</b>	The Local Member, Cllr Paul Fuller spoke on this item, but in accordance with paragraph 24 of the code of practise, in the Council's Constitution, he was unable to vote.  Additional information was sought regarding the glazed tile element of the proposal including levels of reflection, weather wear and colour options. Members also raised concern regarding possible overlooking into the neighbouring property from the upper elements of the proposal and researched possible methods of mitigation. Members concluded that the

application was imaginative and of a good quality, fitting well amongst an eclectic mix of properties.

**Decision:**

The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under the paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

- i) THAT officers be delegated powers to determine the level of mitigation required to overcome the concerns regarding overlooking into the neighbouring property.
- ii) THAT the application be approved.

**Conditions:**

As per report  
(Item 2)

---

**Application:**

[TCP/13719/G](#)

**Details:**

Proposed residential development of 2 bungalows with parking (revised scheme) (revised site plan) (readvertised application).

Land between and rear of May Cottage and West Wind, Bay Road, Freshwater, Isle of Wight.

**Site Visits:**

The site was visited by the Planning Sub Committee members on Friday, 15 February 2013.

**Public**

**Participants:**

Mr Melvyn Bannister (Objector)  
Mr Glen Hepburn (Objector)

Janet Kendall (On behalf of Applicant)

**Additional Representations:**

An additional letter of representation had been received from a neighbouring property objecting to the application based on the proximity of the proposed bungalows.

**Amendments:**

It was noted that the reason given to support condition 12 incorrectly made reference to the setting of a neighbouring listed building and that this wording should be removed.

**Comment:**

The Local Member, Cllr George Cameron spoke on this item, but in accordance with paragraph 24 of the code of practise, in the Council's Constitution, he was unable to vote.

Members noted the previous planning history of the site but noted the changes to policy context since those applications were considered. Clarification was sought regarding the proposed parking provision, the proposed access road including separation distances and ownership of Bay Road. Additional information was requested about the comments of AONB, who had previously objected to three dwellings but deemed two as acceptable and the impact of traffic noise and potential car exhaust fumes on neighbouring properties, including how this could be mitigated.

- Decision:** The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under the paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:
- i) THAT officers be given delegated powers to amend condition 8 insofar as to agree details of the materials to be used for the access road and turning area to mitigate noise generation.
  - ii) THAT officers be given delegated powers to include an appropriately worded condition to limit the number of vehicle parking spaces per new dwelling to a maximum of two.
  - iii) THAT officers be given delegated powers to amend condition 8 to ensure sufficient boundary treatment and screening to reduce the impact to the occupiers of May Cottage.
  - iv) That the application be approved.

**Conditions:** As per report with amendments and additions as delegated to officers.  
(Item 3)

---

**Application:** [TCP/29520/B](#)

**Details:** Change of use from nursery to holiday use (touring caravans) in association with Southlands Camping Park; stopping up of vehicle access onto Wacklands Lane; provision of outdoor swimming pool with associated facilities; alterations to existing toilet block to upgrade facilities.  
Sunnycrest Nurseries, Wacklands Lane, Newchurch, Sandown, Isle of Wight.

**Site Visits:** The site was visited by the Planning Sub Committee members on Friday, 15 February 2013.

**Additional Representations:** None.

**Comment:** Members noted the concerns regarding the unsuitability of Harbors Lake Lane providing vehicular access to the site and were advised that the issue could be highlighted to the applicant through an informative. There was further discussion in relation to the restrictions of Wacklands Lane and the levels of screening required to provide sufficient screening to Winchfield Cottage. Officers advised this could be controlled through the proposed condition relating to a landscaping scheme.

**Decision:** The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under the

paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

- i) THAT the attached conditions and specifically condition 4 be amended sufficiently to control access via Wacklands Lane for emergency vehicle access only.
- ii) THAT an informative be issued to highlight the concerns of the unsuitability of Harbors Lake Lane for caravans to access the site.
- iii) THAT the application be approved.

**Conditions:** As per report as amended  
(Item 4)

---

**Application:** [TCP/31269](#)

**Details:** Pair of semi-detached houses with parking (revised plans) (reduced scheme).  
Land adjacent 2b Adam Terrace off, St. Davids Road, East Cowes, Isle of Wight.

**Site Visits:** The site was visited by the Planning Sub Committee members on Friday, 15 February 2013.

**Public Participants:** Mr Gary Lacey (Objector)  
Simon Walker (East Cowes Town Council)

**Additional Representations:** None.

**Comment:** The Local Member, Cllr Margaret Webster spoke on this item.  
Members noted that vehicular access to the site was via the forecourt of two existing properties and there was some discussion in relation to retaining the current parking provision. Officers advised that the conditions attached to the existing adjacent properties were inconcise regarding retention of the spaces, although the proposed conditions for the application could be amended, provided the inclusion was reasonable.  
Issues relating to the continued maintenance of the proposed drainage and permeable solutions were also debated, with officers advising this could be controlled within the recommended management plan and amendment to the proposed conditions. In addition members sought clarification in regard to the proposed landscaping of the site.

**Decision:** The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under the paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

- i) THAT officers be delegated powers to amend conditions relating to drainage, landscaping and car parking to ensure that they are reflective of the link between the existing and proposed sites (in terms of site ownerships), to ensure that sufficient parking is provided, that a detailed drainage solution is devised including details and calculations to inform the design of the soak away solution and to ensure landscape enhancements are accommodated.
- ii) THAT the application be approved.

**Conditions:** As per report with amendments and additions as delegated to officers in respect of conditions 4, 6, 7 and 10.  
(Item 5)

---

[In line with the Council's Constitution Procedure Rule 22, as the meeting was likely to exceed three hours, members agreed by majority to extend the meeting for one hour.](#)

---

**Application:** [TCP/27373/B](#)

**Details:** Alterations and conversion of existing barn to form one unit of holiday accommodation including recladding of barn and new deck area (revised scheme).

Part OS Parcel 2721, land opposite Primrose Cottages, Mount Road, East Cowes, Isle of Wight.

**Site Visits:** The site was visited by the Planning Sub Committee members on Friday, 15 February 2013.

**Public** Luie Davison (Objector)

**Participants:** Val Taylor (Whippingham Parish Council)

Mr David Long (Agent)

**Additional Representations:** None.

**Comment:** The Local Member, Cllr Edward Giles spoke on this item.

Members noted that there had been previous enhancements to the building without planning permission and were advised that following investigation by planning enforcement officers no further action had been necessary. Officers advised that the application was outside of the development envelope and would convert the existing building to provide holiday accommodation. Members were concerned that the building could be misused as a permanent dwelling and were advised that enforceable conditions had been applied to prevent such use.

A number of concerns were raised regarding the impact of the proposal and whether the application would protect, conserve or enhance the Islands natural and historical environment. Furthermore members debated if the application would conserve, enhance or promote the landscape of the Island, it being located within an unspoilt natural environment. Details were also sought in regard to the safety of the proposed access and issues were raised in regard to the proposed design.

**Decision:**

The Committee had taken into consideration the reasons for the recommendation as set out under the paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report.

A proposal was put forward to approve the application. A vote on the motion was taken and the proposal to approve the application fell.

A further proposal was put forward to refuse the application. In compliance with the Council's Constitution a named vote was taken as the decision was contrary to officer recommendation.

**For (6)**

Cllrs George Cameron, Vanessa Churchman, Paul Fuller, John Hobart, Richard Hollis, Susan Scoccia

**Against (2)**

Cllrs Arthur Taylor, David Williams

**RESOLVED:**

THAT the application be refused.

**Reasons:**

Members were concerned that the design and appearance of the proposed conversion in conjunction with the activity associated with the external parking and turning areas required for a unit of holiday accommodation in this isolated location would result in an unacceptable development within the countryside which would be harmful to the character, tranquillity and appearance of the rural environment, contrary to policy SP5 of the Island Plan Core Strategy.

(Item 6)

---

[In line with the Council's Constitution Procedure Rule 22, as the meeting had exceeded the agreed extension of one hour, members agreed by majority to extend the meeting to conclude the business within Paper B of the published report.](#)

---

**Application:** [TCP/23150/D](#)

**Details:** Demolition of existing school; outline for residential development of 50 dwellings with associated parking (revised description -

revised plans - revised site layout) (readvertised application).

West Wight County Middle School, Windmill Lane, Freshwater, Isle of Wight.

**Site Visits:** The site was visited by the Planning Sub Committee members on Friday, 15 February 2013.

**Additional Representations:** Officers advised that following a further consultation on the application, Freshwater Parish Council had not revised their previous comments. An additional letter from a neighbouring property had been received, as had a letter from the Freshwater Village Association drawing attention to the perceived incorrect use of common land. Officers highlighted that the application did not include common land.

**Comment:** The Local Member, Cllr George Cameron spoke on this item, but in accordance with paragraph 24 of the code of practise, in the Council's Constitution, he was unable to vote.

Members questioned access to the site and were informed that Windmill Lane was unadopted but would be remodelled and constructed to highway specification and it would be the decision of the developer if they chose to offer the road for adoption by the authority. Members noted that the development would offer 65% affordable housing on site against a policy provision of only 35%.

**Decision:** The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under the paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

THAT the application be approved.

**Conditions:** As per report  
(Item 1)

---

Cllr Susan Scoccia declared a personal and pecuniary interest and left the room for this item.

**Application:** [TCP/23899/K](#)

**Details:** Proposed installation of detached dry cleaning, key cutting and shoe repair pod.

Tesco Stores Ltd, Brading Road, Ryde, Isle of Wight.

**Site Visits:** The site was visited by the Planning Sub Committee members on Friday, 15 February 2013.

**Additional Representations:** Additional comments had been received from a third party questioning the expertise of the company proposing to provide the services.

**Comment:** The Local Member, Cllr Reg Barry against this item, but in



accordance with paragraph 24 of the code of practise, in the Council's Constitution, he was unable to vote.

Members noted that the services would be provided through a concessionaire and that if the application was not granted permission, the applicants would be able to provide the services in store without requiring permission. Members voiced concern regarding the detrimental impact that the kiosk and services provided would have on the sustainability of Ryde town centre and local village outlets.

**Decision:** In compliance with the Council's Constitution a named vote was taken as the decision was contrary to officer recommendation.

**For (6)**

Cllrs George Cameron, Vanessa Churchman, Paul Fuller, John Hobart, Richard Hollis, Arthur Taylor.

**Against (0)**

**Abstentions (1)**

Cllr David Williams

**Reasons:** Members believed that the proposal would detract from town centres and was contrary to policy DM9 of the Island Plan Core Strategy (Item 7)

---

b) **Second and Third Quarter reports (year 12/13) on the outcome of planning appeals**

Owing to the late hour it was agreed to defer this item to the following meeting of the Sub Committee.

43. **Members' Question Time**

Cllr Vanessa Churchman asked a question relating to permitted development rights and the loss of light following recent press announcements. The Head of Regulatory Services stated he was aware of the press reports but further analysis of the detail was required and that members would be briefed once this had been completed.

CHAIRMAN