



Minutes

Name of meeting	PLANNING COMMITTEE
Date and time	TUESDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2011 COMMENCING AT 4.00 PM
Venue	COUNCIL CHAMBER, COUNTY HALL, NEWPORT, ISLE OF WIGHT
Present	Cllrs Richard Hollis (Chairman), Vanessa Churchman, Paul Fuller, John Hobart, Julie Jones-Evans, Susan Scoccia, Arthur Taylor, Jerry White
Also Present (non voting)	Cllr George Brown, Dawn Cousins, Chris Welsford
Officers Present	Bill Berry, Jean Chambers, Russell Chick, Bill Murphy, Anna Priestly, Phil Salmon, Justin Thorne, Stuart Van-Cuylenburg, Alan White, Andrew White, Simon Wiggins, Sarah Wilkinson
Apologies	Cllrs Reg Barry, David Knowles

15. [Minutes](#)

RESOLVED :

THAT the Minutes of the meeting held on [1 November 2011](#) be confirmed.

16. [Declarations of Interest](#)

Cllr John Hobart declared a personal and prejudicial interest in Minute 17 (items 1, 2 and 3) - Former Whitecroft Hospital, Sandy Lane, Newport, Isle of Wight, as he lived in the vicinity of the application site.

Cllr Richard Hollis declared a personal interest in Minute 17 (4) – St Nicholas House, 58 St Johns Road, Newport, as he knew people who lived in the vicinity.

Cllr Susan Scoccia declared a personal interest in Minute 17 (7) – 8 Lower Hyde Road, Shanklin, as a personal friend lived in the vicinity.

Cllr Susan Scoccia declared a personal and prejudicial interest in Minute 17 (8) - Land rear of St. Ann's, and adjacent High Trees, Southgrove Road, Ventnor, Isle of Wight – as she was a trustee at St Catherine's School who were the applicant.

17. Report of the Head of Planning and Regulatory Services

(a) Planning Applications and Related Matters

Consideration was given to items 1 - 10 of the report of the Head of Planning and Regulatory Services.

RESOLVED :

THAT the applications be determined as detailed below :

The reasons for the resolutions made in accordance with Officer recommendation were given in the Planning report. Where resolutions are made contrary to Officer recommendation the reasons for doing so are contained in the minutes.

A schedule of additional representations received after the printing of the report were submitted at the beginning of the meeting and were drawn to the attention of Members when considering the application. A note is made to that effect in the minutes.

Cllr John Hobart declared a personal and prejudicial interest and left the room for this item.

Applications: [TCPL/24342/L, LBC/24342/K and CAC/24342/J](#)

Details: Demolition of partially completed structures, chapel, PCT building and laundry block; residential development comprising a total of 122 units, (construction of 60 houses; retention of apartments as built in blocks D, RT and T; conversion of blocks A, B, C and H into apartments, (62 in total)); retention of marketing suite; associated parking and landscaping; alterations to pedestrian access; satellite dish; 3 air conditioning chiller units (Revised plans)(Re-advertised application) (variation to the Legal Agreement) (further consultation).

and

LBC for demolition of partially completed structures, chapel, PCT building and laundry block; residential development comprising a total of 122 units, (construction of 60 houses; retention of apartments as built in blocks D, RT and T; conversion of blocks A, B, C and H into apartments, (62 in total)); retention of marketing suite; associated parking and landscaping; alterations to pedestrian access; satellite dish; 3 air conditioning chiller units (Revised plans)(Re-advertised application).

and

Conservation Area Consent for demolition of partially completed structures, chapel, PCT building and laundry block; residential development comprising a total of 122 units, (construction of 60 houses; retention of apartments as built in blocks D, RT and T;

conversion of blocks A, B, C and H into apartments, (62 in total)); retention of marketing suite; associated parking and landscaping; alterations to pedestrian access; satellite dish; 3 air conditioning chiller units (Revised plans)(Re-advertised application).

Former Whitecroft Hospital, Sandy Lane, Newport, Isle of Wight.

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 25 November 2011.

Public Participants: Mr Hale (Agent)

Additional Representations: The original comments received from Newport Parish Council had raised concern about the inclusion of non-indigenous species as part of the landscaping scheme. Officers accepted not all species proposed were indigenous however, the scheme respected the original Victorian parkland character and therefore the species indicated were appropriate.

Amendments: To provide further clarity Planning Officers amended paragraph 6.64 of the report to read:

Comments have been raised by the applicants with regards to the reasonableness and enforceability of the restriction in respect of the restriction on domestic cats. Given that there is no up to date specific survey data available on dormice populations around Whitecroft, the impact of allowing domestic cats onto the site remains undetermined. As such, officers are satisfied that the restriction on domestic cats remains reasonable. The current Section 106 Agreement requires a covenant to be placed on each unit and that the owner shall submit to the Council the standard form of transfer or lease to be used on all future dispositions of residential units within the site. It is considered that this would make the restriction enforceable.

Comment: The Deputy Head of Planning (Development) read out a statement on behalf of the Whitecroft Residents Association objecting to the application.

Committee members enquired why the proposed W6 units were recommended for refusal by officers due to their design and external appearance being out of context with the character of the area, when unit W7 was deemed acceptable, as both units were of a contemporary design.

Members were of the opinion that the proposed plans for the W7 unit were out of keeping with the character of the area and had concerns about the impact on the Conservation Area.

Decision: The Committee had taken into consideration the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report:

A proposal was put forward to approve the application in line with officer recommendation. A vote on the motion was taken and the proposal to approve the application fell.

A further proposal to agree all elements of the officer recommendation with the exception of unit W7, which was to be refused, was put forward. In compliance with the Council's Constitution a named vote was taken as the decision was contrary to officer recommendation.

For (4)

Cllrs Vanessa Churchman, Paul Fuller, Richard Hollis, Jerry White.

Against (3)

Cllrs Julie Jones-Evans, Susan Scoccia, Arthur Taylor

RESOLVED:

- i) THAT units W 6 and W7 be refused.
- ii) THAT all other elements contained within the officer recommendation be agreed.

Reasons for Refusal (i):

The proposed units known as W7 by reason of their design and external appearance would be out of context with the prevailing character of the area, which is designated as a Conservation Area, failing to enhance or preserve the current amenity value and accordingly the units would be contrary to Planning Policy Statement 5: Planning for the Historic Environment.

Additional Conditions (ii):

- (25) - Prior to the marketing suite hereby approved becoming operational a screen shall be erected to a section of the south western elevation of the 'T' building of a style and in a manner to be agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority. The screen shall obscure the air conditioning chiller units and be retained for the time that the chiller units are positioned at this point of the buildings.

Reason: In the interests of the visual amenities of the area in accordance with Policy D1 (Standards of Design) of the Isle of Wight Unitary Development Plan.

- (26) - Prior to any additional units within the 'T' building being occupied details of the diameter of the satellite dish and height of the tripod to which it shall be

attached shall be submitted to and approved in writing with the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of the visual amenities of the area in accordance with Policy D1 (Standards of Design) of the Isle of Wight Unitary Development Plan.

(Items 1,2 and 3)

Application: [TCPL/13450/K and LBC/13450/J](#)

Details: Alterations; upgrading of extraction system including new flue; variation of condition no.1 on TCP/13450/G/MB/2581 which restricts opening hours (revised scheme)(readvertised application).

and

LBC for alterations; upgrading of extraction system including new flue (revised scheme)(readvertised application).

Island Images, 143 High Street, Newport, Isle of Wight.

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 25 November 2011.

Public Mr Perry (Objector)

Participants: Mr Barton (Agent)

Additional Representations: Newport Parish Council had submitted additional representations which maintained their objection to the application on the grounds of increased noise and disturbance and the further loss of residential amenity during the small hours for those living in the High Street and to the rear of the premises.

Amendments: An error had been identified within Condition 6 of the report and should read:

No customers shall be permitted on the premises outside the following times:

0900 to 0100 Wednesdays to Saturdays

0900 to 0000 Sundays to Tuesdays

0900 to 0000 Bank and Public Holidays

Reason: To protect the amenities of nearby residential properties in particular and the amenities of the surrounding area in general and to comply with policy D1 (Standards of Design) of the Isle of Wight Unitary Development Plan.

Comment: The Local Member, Cllr Dawn Cousins, spoke on this item.

Members sought clarification on the estimated level of noise created through the operation of the proposed extractor units and were advised by the Environmental Health Officer that levels would be within the region of 28 DbA, as stated within the

submitted noise report. It was highlighted that this was below the World Health Organisations recommended levels and deemed very low within a town centre location.

Members noted the concerns about noise disturbance and anti social behaviour but acknowledged that the Licensing Committee were able to review those issues.

Decision: The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

THAT the application be approved.

Conditions: As per report
(Items 5 and 6)

Application: [TCP/30523/A](#)

Details: Single storey extension to enlarge kitchen; extension at 1st floor over garage to form bedroom (revised scheme).

8 Lower Hyde Road, Shanklin, Isle of Wight.

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 25 November 2011.

Public Participants: Mr Williams (On behalf of the Applicant)

Comment: Members debated as to whether the loss of the gap between the properties would be detrimental to the street scene.

Decision: The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

- i) THAT the first floor extension be refused.
- ii) THAT the single storey extension be approved.

Reasons/ As per report

Conditions: (Item 7)

Cllr Susan Scoccia declared a personal and prejudicial interest and left the room for this item.

Application: [TCP/09756/C](#)

Details: Proposed detached dwelling; formation of vehicular access and on-site parking.

Land rear of St. Ann's, and adjacent High Trees, Southgrove Road, Ventnor, Isle of Wight.

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 25 November 2011.

Public Participants: Miss Amos (Objector)
Ms Thompson (Applicant)

Additional Representations: Further comments had been received from the Building Control Manager in respect to the construction of the proposed drainage system.

Comment: The Local Member, Cllr Chris Welsford, spoke on this item.
The Committee balanced the contemporary design of the application and the impacts on the character of the area containing Victorian properties save for the neighbouring property, High Trees. Further clarity was also sought in regard to ground stability.

Decision: The Committee had taken into consideration the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report:

A proposal was put forward to refuse the application. In compliance with the Council's Constitution a named vote was taken as the decision was contrary to officer recommendation.

For (3)
Cllrs John Hobart, Richard Hollis, Jerry White

Against (2)
Cllrs Vanessa Churchman, Paul Fuller

Abstentions (1)
Cllr Julie Jones-Evans

Reasons: The proposed dwelling would be of a scale, mass design and materials that would not respect the character and appearance of the Conservation Area and the street scene and the loss of the open space would be detrimental to the character of the Conservation Area.
(Item 8)

Application: [TCP/20345/C](#)

Details: Two storey side extension to provide additional living accommodation (revised scheme).

20 Matthews Way, Seaview, Isle of Wight.

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 25 November 2011.

Public Participants: Mr Harvey (Objector)
John Turner (On behalf of Seaview Parish Council)

Mr Hougham (Agent)

Comment: A statement from the Local Member, Cllr Reg Barry, was read out by Cllr Julie Jones-Evans, as he was unable to be present.

Decision: The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

THAT the application be approved.

Conditions: As per report
(Item 9)

Application: [TCP/27704/C](#)

Details: Proposed front extensions to create gym, bathroom, dressing room, two w.c.s and stores at the lower ground floor; alterations to fenestration to include french double doors with juliet balcony on rear elevation, alterations to front elevation windows and alterations to side elevation windows; an external staircase; increase height of garage; enclosure of part of rear balcony to increase lounge size (revised description)(readadvertised application).

Bisous, Bonchurch Shute, Ventnor, Isle of Wight.

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 25 November 2011.

Public Participants: Mr White (Objector)

Comment: The Local Member, Cllr Chris Welsford, spoke on this item.

Members noted the application proposed various amendments to a previously approved scheme. It was stated that the footprint of the property would not increase and that the alterations were more alterations to the layout and fenestration except the increase to the height of the garage. Members queried the issue of ground stability and the lack of any form of boundary treatment between neighbouring properties.

Decision: The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

THAT the application be approved

Conditions: Additional Condition:

(9) – No development shall take place until details have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority of the positions, design, materials and type of boundary treatment to be

erected on the south west boundary of the property. The boundary treatment shall be completed before the dwelling that is the subject of this application is occupied. Development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: In the interests of maintaining the amenity value of the area and to comply with policy D1 (Standards of Design) of the Isle of Wight Unitary Development Plan.

(Item 10)

Application: [TCP/30379/A](#)

Details: Demolition of buildings; proposed residential development of four pairs of semi-detached houses; alterations and conversion of office building to form a dwelling; alterations to vehicular/pedestrian access; new pedestrian route through site; landscaping; parking.

St Nicholas House, 58 St. Johns Road, Newport, Isle Of Wight.

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 25 November 2011.

Amendments: Officers had noted that paragraph 6.32 of the report (which focuses on parking provision) referred to a total of twenty bedrooms throughout the proposed development. This reference was an error and it should be noted that the correct total was thirty four. However, the calculations undertaken and the percentage of parking provision referred to within the report were correct.

Comment: Since publication of the Committee report officers had noted that the ground floor boardroom of the existing property contained Oak panelling and an Arts and Crafts style fireplace and that there were two interesting staircases. Officers recommended an informative advising that they should be carefully removed in the event of demolition.

Members believed this was a much improved scheme to that previously proposed but sought clarification on use of the footpath and land ownership.

Decision: The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

- i) THAT the application be approved.
- ii) THAT an informative be included within the decision notice stating the Oak panelling, fireplace and original timber staircases be dismantled in accordance with a written method statement submitted to and agreed in writing by the Local

Planning Authority before works commence on site. Once dismantled the artefacts shall be stored at a dry and secure location to be agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority as part of the written method statement until such time as a suitable location is secured for their re-use.

Conditions: (Item 4)

(b) **Mid year report (Year 2011/12) on the outcome of Planning Appeals.**

Owing to the late hour, the Chairman proposed that this item be deferred to the next meeting of the Planning Committee.

RESOLVED:

THAT the item be deferred to the next meeting.

18. **Members' Question Time**

Cllr Julie Jones-Evans asked a question in relation to any further weight which could be brought to bear by the committee in regard to enforcement action. The Head of Planning and Regulatory Services stated all enforcement complaints were tested against the Enforcement Policy which was used to assess the seriousness of the alleged breach.

CHAIRMAN