



Minutes

Name of meeting	PLANNING COMMITTEE
Date and time	TUESDAY, 25 AUGUST 2009 COMMENCING AT 4.00 PM
Venue	COUNCIL CHAMBER, COUNTY HALL, NEWPORT, ISLE OF WIGHT
Present	Cllrs Ivan Bulwer (Chairman), George Cameron, Stuart Dyer, Paul Fuller, John Hobart, Julie Jones-Evans, Susan Scoccia, David Whittaker
Also Present (non voting)	Cllrs George Brown, Roger Mazillius
Officers Present	Martin Mew, Bill Murphy, Justin Thorne, Gavin Toogood, Andrew White, Simon Wiggins, Sarah Wilkinson, Stephen Wiltshire
Apologies	Cllrs Roger Dixcey, Richard Hollis, Adrian Whittaker

9. [Minutes](#)

RESOLVED :

THAT the Minutes of the meeting held on [21 July 2009](#) be confirmed.

10. [Declarations of Interest](#)

Councillor Ivan Bulwer declared a personal interest in Minute 11 (2) – Site of the Moorings and The Gables, Egypt Hill, Cowes, as he knew the applicant as a close neighbour.

Councillor Paul Fuller declared a personal interest in Minute 11 (2) - Site of the Moorings and The Gables, Egypt Hill, Cowes – 11 (3) - Brambles, Egypt Hill, Cowes and – 11 (4) - Egypt Cottage, Egypt Hill, Cowes as he was the local member.

11. **Report of the Head of Planning Services**

(a) **Planning Applications and Related Matters**

Consideration was given to items 1 - 5 of the report of the Head of Planning Services.

RESOLVED :

THAT the applications be determined as detailed below :

The reasons for the resolutions made in accordance with Officer recommendation were given in the Planning report. Where resolutions are made contrary to Officer recommendation the reasons for doing so are contained in the minutes.

A schedule of additional representations received after the printing of the report were submitted at the beginning of the meeting and were drawn to the attention of Members when considering the application. A note is made to that effect in the minutes.

Application: [TCP/10484/P](#)

Details: Full planning permission for improvements to the junction of Partridge Road and Parkhurst Road and widening and reconstruction of Hewitt Crescent. Outline for residential development comprising 42 houses and 12 flats; parking (revised description)(readvertised application).

Former Isle of Wight Council Library Headquarters, Parkhurst Road, Newport, Isle of Wight.

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 21 August 2009.

Public Mr Fred Harrison (Objector)

Participants: Mr Roger Barton (Objector)

Additional Representations: None

Comment: The adjoining Member, Cllr Roger Mazillius, spoke on this item on behalf of the Local Member.

Decision: The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

THAT the application be approved.

Conditions: As per report but with the following amendments:

- Condition 4 – 1st Line after the word development insert “including any of the required road improvements”.
- Condition 6 – should cross reference to Condition 5 and not 4.
- Condition 13 – after the word manner insert “and within a timescale”.

Additional conditions as follows :

11. Prior to construction work on the houses commencing or at the time of ant reserved matters application an up to date badger survey shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority identifying any area of the site which falls within 1km of a badger sett.

Reason: Badgers are protected under the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981, as amended in accordance with Planning Policy Statement 9: Biodiversity and Geological Conservation.

12. Prior to work commencing on site a phasing plan for works shall be submitted to and agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The agreed plan shall be adhered to throughout the construction process.

Reason: To ensure that the appropriate infrastructure is in place to service the development and to comply with TR7 (Highway Considerations for New Development) of the Isle of Wight Unitary Development Plan.

13. The existing access to the site from Parkhurst Road shall be closed off to vehicular traffic in a manner to be agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority

Reason: In the interest of highway safety and to accord with Policy TR7 (Highway Considerations of New Development) of the Isle of Wight Unitary Development Plan.

(Item 1)

Application:	TCP/21358/J
Details:	Demolition of "The Gables"; construction of eight detached houses with garages/parking; vehicular access; proposed two storey extension to provide additional bedroom accommodation for existing care home (The Moorings).
	Site of The Moorings and The Gables, Egypt Hill, Cowes, Isle of Wight.
Site Visits:	The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 21 August 2009.
Public Participants:	Mrs Ann Thwaites (Objector) Mr Mike Holmes (Applicant)
Additional Representations:	An additional letter of objection had been received from a neighbouring property. An additional letter of support had been received. A revised rear elevation to Unit 5 had been submitted. The amendment would result in a hipped roof with a roof light, to provide light into a proposed dressing room. This would replace the previously proposed glazed gable.
Comment:	In compliance with the Council's Constitution the local member, Cllr Paul Fuller, did not vote.

Decision: The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation in respect of the renovation and extension of the Moorings as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved not to adopt the recommendation put forward but to issue a split decision as follows:

- (i) THAT the proposed works to the residential care home including, the refurbishment of the existing facility to provide en-suite bedrooms, new bathrooms and a new lounge. The proposed extension providing a further 21 en-suite bedrooms and a lift be approved.
- (ii) THAT the proposed housing providing 3 – 4 bedroom accommodation over three floors utilising the roof space and ground floor levels within the design and being constructed of a mix of brick and timber style boarding, under slate roofs be refused.

In compliance with the Council's Constitution a named vote was taken as the decision was contrary to officer recommendation.

For (6)

Cllrs George Cameron, Stuart Dyer, John Hobart, Julie Jones-Evans, Susan Scoccia, David Whittaker.

Against (1)

Cllr Ivan Bulwer.

Reasons: Members believed the proposed housing by virtue of the height and density would result in an overdevelopment of the site. This would lead to an unacceptable impact on the verdant nature of the area, the Conservation area and the locality in general. Contrary to policies D1, G4, PPS 1, PPS 3 and PPG 15 of the Isle of Wight Council Unitary Development Plan.

(Item 2)

Application: [TCP/12261/D](#)
Details: Demolition of dwelling; residential development comprising 3 detached houses with car ports, parking and bin store with access off Egypt Hill.
Brambles, Egypt Hill, Cowes, Isle of Wight.

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 21 August 2009.

Public Participants: Miss Debbie Smith (Objector)

Additional Representations:	<p>An additional letter had been received from the owner of a property in Egypt Hill.</p> <p>The owner of St Eanswythe, Egypt Hill had submitted an additional letter objecting to the application and raising a number of points.</p> <p>The Planning Officer confirmed that surface water disposal had been addressed within the report. The applicant had submitted a letter dated 30 March 2009, confirming that all of the land within the red line area including visibility splays was in their ownership. Issues relating to ground stability, loss of trees and impact on wildlife habitats had been addressed within the report.</p>
Comment:	<p>Officers drew member's attention to a report from the Ecology Officer, following an inspection of the site in regard to the potential presence of bats. It was noted that bats were not in residence in the existing property and that it was an unsuitable for bats.</p> <p>In compliance with the Council's Constitution the local member, Cllr Paul Fuller, did not vote.</p>
Decision:	<p>The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) THAT the dwellings constituting Plots 1 and 2 be approved. (ii) THAT the dwelling constituting Plot 3 be refused.
Conditions and Reasons:	As per report (Item 3)
Application:	TCP/17809/C
Details:	Demolition of dwelling; outline for 2 detached dwellings; vehicular access (revised plans)(readadvertised application).
Site Visits:	<p>Egypt Cottage, Baring Road, Cowes, Isle of Wight.</p> <p>The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 21 August 2009.</p>
Public Participants:	<p>Mrs Fiona Campbell (Objector)</p> <p>Mr Paul Airey (Agent)</p>
Additional Representations:	None.
Comment:	Officers drew member's attention to a report from the Ecology Officer, following an inspection of the site in regard to the potential presence of bats. It was noted that bats were not in residence in the existing property.

In compliance with the Council's Constitution the local member, Cllr Paul Fuller, did not vote.

Decision:

The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

THAT the application be refused.

Reasons:

As per report but with the following additional reason:

The proposed subdivision of the site to provide two detached dwellings with associated parking would constitute in an overdevelopment of the site by virtue of the location and dimensions, having an adverse impact on the character of the area. Contrary to policies D1, G4 and PPS 1 of the Isle of Wight Council Unitary Development Plan.

(Item 4)

Application:

TCPL/13183/G

Details:

Alterations; replacement shopfront; proposed opening in boundary wall to form fire exit; fascia sign with trough lighting, 1 x non-illuminated projecting sign.

Batemans (Opticians) Ltd, 120 High Street, Newport, Isle of Wight.

This application was deferred prior to the meeting at the request of Planning Officers.

(Item 5)

(b) [P/02019/07 – Conservatory at 148 Binstead Lodge Road, Ryde, Isle of Wight](#)

Members were asked whether it was expedient to take enforcement action in respect to an unauthorised conservatory at the rear of 148 Binstead Lodge Road, Ryde. Planning permission had been granted in October 2007 for a single storey extension to form an enlarged garage, conservatory with raised decking, summer house and replacement shed.

It was noted that the applicants had sought agreement for alterations to the original approved scheme by way of an amendment request in November 2008; those amendments were considered by the Planning Committee in December 2008. At that meeting the Committee resolved to refuse to accept the change in the roof design of the conservatory but agreed the remaining changes as amendments.

The unauthorised conservatory remained in place and a planning application for the retention of the conservatory had not been submitted.

RESOLVED:

THAT the enforcement case be closed with no further action to be taken in respect of the unauthorised conservatory.

(c) [P/00451/07 38A Denmark Road, Cowes, Isle of Wight](#)

Members noted that plans for a detached house with bedroom accommodation within the roofspace, parking and alterations to vehicular access off Denmark Road had been approved, subject to twelve conditions on 16 April 2007.

Following an Enforcement investigation which had discovered that the development was not being built in accordance with the approved plans, a revised plans application was submitted. The application was considered by the Planning Committee on 24 February 2009, where members concluded to refuse consent. Following the refusal, the applicant had exercised their right of Appeal and members were advised on the refusal decision of the Inspector.

Officers had met with the applicants and their agents in order to overcome the issues that had been raised by the Planning Inspectorate and this had resulted in a series of preliminary sketches being commented on and a comprehensive list of points being provided to the agent as a baseline from which a more acceptable scheme could be derived.

RESOLVED:

- i. THAT pre-application discussion be undertaken with the Local Planning Authority prior to the submission of any application.
- ii. THAT an application be submitted not later than 11 September 2009.
- iii. THAT the application be referred to the Planning Committee on 27 October 2009.
- iv. THAT should the applicant fail to submit an application of an acceptable standard, addressing the reasons for the dismissal of the appeal inspector by 11 September 2009, Officers serve an Enforcement notice requiring the demolition of the property.

12. [Members' Question Time](#)

Cllr Susan Scoccia asked a question in relation to the access for the two approved houses at Brambles, Egypt Hill Cowes. A reply was given.

Cllr Julie Jones-Evans asked a question in relation to the structure of the Conservation Team. A reply was given.

Cllr Julie Jones-Evans asked a question in relation to Conservation Management Plans. A reply was given.

CHAIRMAN