



Minutes

Name of meeting	PLANNING COMMITTEE
Date and time	TUESDAY, 24 MARCH 2009 COMMENCING AT 4.00 PM
Venue	COUNCIL CHAMBER, COUNTY HALL, NEWPORT, ISLE OF WIGHT
Present	Cllrs Ivan Bulwer (Chairman), Henry Adams, William Burt, George Cameron, Charles Chapman, Mike Cunningham, Roger Dixcey, John Hobart, Gill Kennett, Lady Pigot, Susan Scoccia, Ian Stephens, David Williams (2 Vacancies)
Also Present (non voting)	Cllr Alan Wells
Officers Present	Russell Chick, Steve Cornwell, Lizzie Frood, Keith Jolliffe, John MacKenzie, Julie Martin, Dave Moore, Bill Murphy Phil Salmon, Justin Thorne, Sarah Wilkinson

47. **Minutes**

RESOLVED :

THAT the Minutes of the meeting held on [24 February 2009](#) be confirmed.

48. **Declarations of Interest**

Cllr Lady Pigot declared a personal interest in Minute 49 (1) - Bembridge Marina car park, Embankment Road, Bembridge – as she was the local member.

Cllr Lady Pigot declared a personal interest in Minute 49 (3) - Bembridge Harbour, Embankment Road, Bembridge – as she was the local member.

49. **Report of the Head of Planning Services**

Planning Applications and Related Matters

Consideration was given to items 1 - 7 of the report of the Head of Planning Services.

RESOLVED :

THAT the applications be determined as detailed below :

The reasons for the resolutions made in accordance with Officer recommendation were given in the Planning report. Where resolutions are made contrary to Officer recommendation the reasons for doing so are contained in the minutes.

A schedule of additional representations received after the printing of the report were submitted at the beginning of the meeting and were drawn to the attention of Members when considering the application. A note is made to that effect in the minutes.

Application: [TCP/17909/U](#)

Details: Demolition of w.c's, showers and office; construction of 4 storey 69 bedroom hotel to include conference/breakfast facilities, restaurant, splash pool and roof top bar; public w.c's and showers for harbour use; parking and alterations to vehicular access (readvertised application).

Bembridge Marina car park, Embankment Road, Bembridge, Isle of Wight.

Site Visits: This site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Monday, 24 March 2009.

Public Participants: Mrs Barbara Clough (Objector)
Mr Mike Samuelson (Objector)

Additional Representations: Two additional letters of objection from local residents had been received.

Letters of objection from the CPRE and the National Trust had been received.

A letter of representation was received on behalf of, BASSHA, BHUG, BHT, BSC, BHYC, National Trust, CRPE and RSPB, objecting to the development.

Certain representations were omitted from the original report and have been included above. Of the third party representations where although the initial number of objections was reported, the grounds were omitted from the report and were subsequently e-mailed to Members but in order to update the report paragraph 5.4.2 should include:

- Grounds.
- Adverse effect on European sites.
- Increased traffic and inadequate car parking.
- Overdevelopment of the site.
- Excessive height.
- Development out of scale and character.
- Inappropriate design and materials.
- 50 year permission is not appropriate.
- Inadequate drainage and drainage problems.
- Noise and light intrusion and pollution.
- Site is liable to flooding in the future.

- No established need for a hotel.
- Loss of heritage and history.
- Loss of an attractive building.
- Creation of a precedent for further development.
- Development outside the designated development envelope therefore contrary to policy.
- Unnecessary development.

Communication from Environment Agency confirming that the Agency has been provided with sufficient evidence to demonstrate that the sequential test had been undertaken and that the Agency's objections have now all been overcome and that it is satisfied with a time limiting permission as detailed in the report.

Comment: In compliance with the Council's Constitution the local member, Cllr Lady Pigot, did not vote.

Decision: The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

THAT the application be refused.

Reasons: As per report and additional reasons as follows :

In light of the discrepancies between the submitted drawings and what was available on site, the proposal was inadequate in terms of the proposed parking provision and was therefore contrary to Policies TR7 and TR16 of the Unitary Development Plan.

The proposed development by virtue of its mass, scale, design and character, including the proposed external materials, the absence of detail on potential light spillage associated with the car parking areas and general activities in and around the hotel proposal were inappropriate in terms of its potential overbearing impact on surrounding residential properties as such was contrary to Policy D1 of the Unitary Development Plan..

The proposal was not in harmony with the character of the surrounding area as set out in the Good Practice Guide for Tourism, as at paragraph 5, which recommended that it should be in harmony with their surrounding environment.

Contrary to Policy D1 of the Unitary Development Plan - The context of the overall development should be in harmony with their surroundings and was contrary to Policy D1 of the Unitary Development Plan and the Good Practice Guide for Tourism.

(Item 1)

Application:	<u>TCP/27927/A</u>
Details:	<p>Outline for industrial/business and residential development and alterations to vehicular access to include provision of a roundabout at Newport Road junction (additional information) (readvertised application).</p> <p>Land north of Whitecross House including part of Whitecross Lane/Newport Road and part of Merrie Gardens Farm, Newport Road, Sandown, Isle of Wight.</p>
Site Visits:	The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Monday, 24 March 2009.
Public Participants:	<p>Mr David Lloyd (Objector)</p> <p>Mr Glen Hepburn (Agent)</p>
Additional Representations:	<p>Although all comments received on the application were taken into consideration in the evaluation and Officer recommendation the following paragraphs contained errors in the number of objection and support that had been received and therefore the following paragraphs should be replaced with the following:</p> <p>5.3 Parish/Town Council Comments</p> <p>Lake Parish Council objects to the proposal on grounds that can be summarised as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Contrary to policy • Drainage has not been fully addressed • No details of cost of the electrical sub-stations or siting of same. • Roundabout has not been environmentally assessed in line with Policy TR8 (The Environmental Impact of New Infrastructure Scheme) <p>Further comments have been submitted by Lake Parish Council supporting the application, on the condition that the roundabout is installed first, before any part of the development is undertaken.</p> <p>5.4 Third Party Representations</p> <p>47 letters of objection have been received from local residents, the issues raised within which can be summarised as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Precedent of developing on an employment site. • Road improvements are not considered sufficient to cope with increased volume of traffic.

- Detrimental impact on environment and residents of the area.
- Increase in traffic levels.
- Increase in vehicle emissions.
- Increase in industrial pollutants and noise.
- Increased factors of risk in road safety.
- Further delays and congestion.
- Increased pressure on drainage and sewage networks.
- Impact on the quality of life.
- Contrary to policy.
- Questions over the need for further housing.
- Consideration of Listed Building.
- Living conditions for future occupants.
- Possible loss of school crossing patrol.
- Access to housing from Whitecross Lane.
- Development of Greenfield land.
- Need for additional car parking due to distance from town centre.
- A possible further decline in wildlife and birds.
- Badgers.
- Trees.
- Pedestrian safety.
- Proposed industrial development should be housing.
- Impact on current balance between housing and industrial land.
- If it is not economically viable to bring forward the industrial land then it should not be developed.
- Proximity of the roundabout the Lake Middle School
- Traffic lights would allow pedestrian to cross more safely
- The infrastructure should be in place prior to any of residential development being undertaken

One letter of support has been received outlining that the proposed development would not have an effect of the listed building, no reason to not allow further employment land, installation of a roundabout can only improve traffic conditions, further employment requires further housing, there is no other suitable area for housing of this scale in the area and improving the areas employment and housing can only benefit the area.

A Listed Building Consent application had been submitted for the reduction in the height and realignment of a wall to the front of the Listed Building to allow for the required visibility splays for the roundabout. Although the application was still to be determined Conservation and Design has raised no objections but made additional comments.

The visibility splays would also see the removal of the trees behind the wall. Those have been examined by the Council's Tree Officer and were not considered to be of any individual merit as they were conifers in the main, with one lime tree. They did have some group value and there would need to be a suitable replanting scheme.

A letter of representation from an objector was submitted to the planning committee.

Comment: None.

Decision: The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

THAT the conditional permission be granted.

Conditions: Additional conditions as follows :

11. The housing units shall be laid out in accordance with drawing no. 701/01/05 and shall not comprise more than 6 separate residential properties.

Reason: In the interest of the amenity and visual character of the area and to accord with Policy D1 (Standards of Design) of the Isle of Wight Unitary Development Plan.

12. The proposed roundabout should be laid out in accordance with the approved drawing no. I/WSLAKE.1/3.

Reason: In the interest of highway safety and to accord with Policy TR7 (Highway Considerations for New Development) of the Isle of Wight Unitary Development Plan

As per report (Item 2)

Application: [TCP/27560/B](#)

Details: Installation of piles and sewage system for 33 houseboats; provision of a boardwalk and repairs to the embankment (revised scheme)

Bembridge Harbour, Embankment Road, Bembridge, Isle of Wight

Site Visits:	The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Monday, 24 March 2009.
Public Participants:	Mr Mike Samuelson (Objector)
Additional Representations:	A letter from BHIC confirming their agreement to the Environment Agency's suggestions that a Section 106 Agreement be entered into to enable works of repairs to the embankment to be carried out without compensation.
Comment:	None.
Decision:	The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved: THAT the application be refused.
Reasons:	As per report (Item 3)
Application:	TCP/23248/B
Details:	Construction of 15 beach huts with car and dinghy park; vehicular access (revised scheme). Land between Yellow Sands and Commodores Court, Duver Road, Seaview, Isle of Wight.
Site Visits:	The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Monday, 24 March 2009.
Public Participants:	Mrs Rayment (Objector) R Mike Rainey (Agent) Mr Andy Barrett (Supporter)
Additional Representations:	Two letters of objection had been received. Natural England had stated that the proposed development would not have a significant impact on the protected areas.
Comment:	The Local Member, Councillor Diana Tuson, had submitted an e-mail outlining her concerns, which were read out at the meeting.
Decision:	The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

- (i) THAT conditional permission be granted for fourteen beach huts, the car and dinghy park.
- (ii) THAT permission be refused for the easternmost proposed beach hut, as identified on the layout plan (RP537/02 Rev F received on 30 May 2008).
- (iii) THAT a formal consultation exercise be undertaken on the Management Plan, if no objections were raised in relation to the Management Plan officers would be given authority to approve it and commencement would go ahead. If during consultation legitimate planning considerations were raised then the application would be bought back to the Planning Committee for consideration.

Conditions:

A revised condition 6 securing nature conservation provision as follows:

No development shall take place until full details of nature conservation enhancements and remediation have been submitted to and agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved scheme. The scheme shall include the following:

- 1) A scheme for a 5m buffer zone for the protection of all water features and vegetation to the south of the proposed boat park;
- 2) Enhancements to water habitats within Hersley Nature Reserve;
- 3) A phasing plan for the undertaking and completion of the habitat improvement in line with the development of the beach huts and dinghy / car parking areas and identifying the appropriate planting season.

Reason: To ensure the continuity of amenity and nature conservation value afforded by water and to avoid damage to nearby vegetation by affecting the water table and in the interests of the preservation and conservation of important natural habitat and to comply with PPS9 (Biodiversity and Geological Conservation)

As per report (Item 4)

Application:

[TCP/17383/D](#)

Details:

Demolition of redundant farm buildings; part conversion, part new build proposal to create accommodation and support facilities for use as seasonal shooting lodge and tourism accommodation; construction of new farm building; courtyard parking (revised description) (readvertised application)

New Barn Farm, Newbarn Lane, Shorwell, Newport, Isle Of Wight.

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Monday, 24 March 2009.

Public Participants: Mr James Attrill (Agent)

Additional Representations: Since the report was published the agent had contacted Planning Officers seeking clarification on the need for condition no. 13 which required the maintenance of a register of people staying in the accommodation. The agent had raised the point that as the scheme was intended to provide serviced accommodation and not self-catering accommodation then the Council should consider this similar to a hotel development. In discussions with Planning Officers the offer had been made to adapt condition no. 11 which required the accommodation was only used for holiday purposes to also make reference to it being serviced and not self-catering accommodation.

On balance, although the accommodation being provided was not strictly hotel accommodation the Local Planning Authority accepted that it did have certain characteristics associated with a hotel, specifically the provision of serviced accommodation rather than self-catering. Accordingly, having considered the matter carefully Officers believe that condition no. 13 requiring the retention of a register could be deleted and that condition no. 11 be revised.

Comment: None.

Decision: The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

THAT the conditional permission be granted.

Conditions: Condition no. 13 requiring the retention of a register be deleted and condition no. 11 be revised as follows:

None of the accommodation hereby approved shall be used other than as serviced holiday accommodation.

Reason: *To ensure that the development remains for holiday purposes and to comply with Policy C17 (Conversion of Barns and other Rural Buildings) of the Isle of Wight Unitary Development Plan.*

As per report (Item 7)

Application:	TCP/25113/H and CAC/25113/G
Details:	Demolition of existing property; pair of semi-detached houses with parking, (revised scheme) and Conservation Area Consent for demolition of existing property; pair of semi-detached houses with parking, (revised scheme) Bridge House, Baring Road, Cowes, Isle of Wight
Site Visits:	The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Monday, 24 March 2009.
Public Participants:	None.
Additional Representations:	With regard to the materials to be used on the proposed development it had been confirmed that the access bridges would comprise timber decks with lightweight stainless steel posts and wires topped with a timber handrail. The balconies would be of similar construction. The architect had confirmed that the external walls would be rendered but no final decision had been made on the colour or whether that would be smooth or textured. The upper storey would be finished with cedar cladding. The roofs would be finished with zinc whilst the windows would be powder coated aluminium. Regarding the route of delivery vehicles to the site during the construction period the Planning and Access Statement indicated that deliveries would take place along Trinity Church Lane but stated that a weight limit would be imposed restricting vehicles to a weight equal to that of the refuse lorry (26 ton laden weight) that already used the lane with a limit on speeds of 5mph. The Statement confirmed that the lane would be kept in a good state of repair to ensure a smooth passage. Where possible, materials would be delivered by crane from Baring Road.
Comment:	None.
Decision:	The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved: THAT the conditional permission be granted.
Conditions:	Condition no. 3 on planning application (P/02417/08) be revised to read as follows:

The materials to be used in the construction of the development hereby approved shall be those as specified in the application which includes the Planning and Access Statement although the final colour and detailing (smooth or textured) of the render which will be applied to the external walls shall be submitted in writing and agreed with the Local Planning Authority prior to any development taking place on site. The development shall then be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: *In the interests of the amenities of the area and to comply with Policy D1 (Standards of Design) of the Isle of Wight Unitary Development Plan.*

New condition no. 15:

Construction traffic visiting the site in association with the proposed development and using Trinity Church Lane shall do so in accordance with the details outlined within section 11.04 of the supporting Planning and Access Statement.

Reason: *To ensure the safe movement of traffic during construction and to comply with Policy TR7 (Highway Considerations) of the Isle of Wight Unitary Development Plan.*

Additional condition relating to the engineers report in paragraph 6.8.3 of the report.

Should the further evidence demonstrate that the impact could go beyond the site that a photographic evidence be taken. The evidence would be dependent upon what the further report indicated.

As per reports (Items 5 and 6)

The meeting then adjourned and reconvened on Wednesday, 25 March 2009 in the Council Chamber, County Hall, Newport, Isle of Wight, commencing at 3.00 pm.	
Present	Cllrs Ivan Bulwer (Chairman), Henry Adams, William Burt, George Cameron, Charles Chapman, Mike Cunningham, Roger Dixcey, John Hobart, Gill Kennett, Lady Pigot, Susan Scoccia, Ian Stephens, David Williams (2 Vacancies)
Also Present (non voting)	Cllrs Barry Abraham, Vanessa Churchman
Officers Present	Mike Gildersleeves, Keith Jolliffe, Julie Martin, Bill Murphy Phil Salmon, Justin Thorne, Gavin Toogood
Apologies	Cllr Charles Chapman

50. **Declarations of Interest**

Mr Bill Murphy, Head of Planning Services declared a personal and prejudicial interest in Minute 51 (9 and 10) – Ryde School, 7 Queens Road, Ryde, as his son attends the school. He was not present during the discussion or voting thereon.

Cllr Henry Adams declared a personal interest in Minute 51 (11) - The Roundhouse, 61 George Street, Ryde – as he was the local member.

51. **Report of the Head of Planning Services**

Planning Applications and Related Matters

Consideration was given to items 8 - 13 of the report of the Head of Planning Services.

RESOLVED :

THAT the applications be determined as detailed below :

The reasons for the resolutions made in accordance with Officer recommendation were given in the Planning report. Where resolutions are made contrary to Officer recommendation the reasons for doing so are contained in the minutes.

A schedule of additional representations received after the printing of the report were submitted at the beginning of the meeting and were drawn to the attention of Members when considering the application. A note is made to that effect in the minutes.

(Mr Bill Murphy, Head of Planning Services, declared a personal and prejudicial interest in this item and was not present during the discussion and voting thereon).

Application: [TCPL/27471/H](#) and [LBC/27471/G](#)

Details: Demolition of no's 11 and 15 Queens Road; proposed construction of 2 storey building to provide additional school facilities; internal alterations to Westmont; alterations and rear extension to Art and CDT building; new access road off Queens Road, car park and additional parking bays; landscaping (revised scheme)

and

LBC for demolition of no's 11 and 15 Queens Road; proposed construction of 2 storey building to provide additional school facilities; internal alterations to Westmont; alterations and rear extension to Art and CDT building; new access road off Queens Road, car park and additional parking bays; landscaping (revised scheme).

Ryde School, 7 Queens Road, Ryde, Isle of Wight

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Monday, 24 March 2009.

Public Participants: Mr Whitby-Smith (Objector)

Mr Tim Wakely (On behalf of Ryde Town Council)

Mr Martyn Davies (Supporter)

Cindy Walters (Architect)

Additional Representations: In the production of the committee report, the conditions associated with both P/00049/09 & P/00054/09 had been incorrectly reported. The full list of conditions was listed.

Comment: Comments from the Local Member, Councillor Arthur Taylor, were read out.

Decision: The application was refused contrary to officer recommendation as members believed the design, mass and scale of the building did not fit in with the street scene.

In compliance with the Council's Constitution a named vote was taken as the decision was contrary to officer recommendation.

[TCPL/27471/H](#)

For (8)

Cllrs Henry Adams, William Burt, George Cameron, Roger Dixcey, John Hobart, Susan Scoccia, Ian Stephens, David Williams

Against (3)

Cllrs Ivan Bulwer, Mike Cunningham, Lady Pigot

THAT the application be refused.

LBC/27471/G

For (9)

Cllrs Henry Adams, Ivan Bulwer, William Burt, George Cameron, Roger Dixcey, John Hobart, Susan Scoccia, Ian Stephens, David Williams

Against (2)

Cllrs Mike Cunningham, Lady Pigot

THAT the application be refused.

Reasons: Design, mass and scale of the building did not fit in with the street scene and the conservation area.

(Items 9 and 10)

Application: [LBC/28174/N](#)

Details: LBC for removal of part of winderstair between 1st and 2nd floors and replacement landing and retention of internal alterations relating to flats 6 and 7 layouts; replacement railings and gate and restoration of wall (revised scheme) (readvertised application)

The Roundhouse, 61 George Street, Ryde, Isle of Wight

Public Participants: Mr Paul Airey (Agent)

Additional Representations: Ryde Town Council objected to the proposal.

Comment: In compliance with the Council's Constitution the local member, Cllr Henry Adams, did not vote.

Decision: The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

THAT the conditional permission be granted (subject to no further comments being received that raise new material

planning considerations not already addressed in this report during the remaining part of the consultation period ending on 27 March 2009).

Conditions: As per report (Item 11)

Application: [TCP/01003/C](#)

Details: Alterations and 1st floor extension to provide additional living accommodation

Kings Reach, Duver Road, Seaview, Isle of Wight

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Monday, 24 March 2009.

Public Participants: Mr Jonathan King (Applicant)

Additional Representations: An e-mail from the local member, Councillor Diana Tuson, was read out.

Comment: None.

Decision: The application was approved contrary to officer recommendation as members believed that due to the diversity of the architecture in the road it would fit in with the street scene.

In compliance with the Council's Constitution a named vote was taken as the decision was contrary to officer recommendation.

For (11)

Cllrs Henry Adams, Ivan Bulwer, William Burt, George Cameron, Mike Cunningham, Roger Dixcey, John Hobart, Lady Pigot, Susan Scoccia, Ian Stephens, David Williams

THAT conditional permission be granted

Conditions: Standard conditions
(Item 12)

Application: [TCP/26116/C](#)

Details: Residential development comprising 4 terraces of three houses and one detached bungalow (13 in total) with parking and access road (aorm)(further revised scheme)

Land between Node Close and, Rotary Court and north of Southfield Gardens, Ryde, Isle of Wight

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 20 February 2009.

Public Participants: None.

Additional Representations: None.

Comment: Members also believed that all of the units should be 2 stories high and not 3 stories.

Decision: The application was refused contrary to officer recommendation as members believed that the modifications that had been put forward were not a significant improvement on the previous application.

In compliance with the Council's Constitution a named vote was taken as the decision was contrary to officer recommendation.

For (9)

Cllrs Henry Adams, Ivan Bulwer, William Burt, George Cameron, Mike Cunningham, John Hobart, Susan Scoccia, Ian Stephens, David Williams

Abstentions (2)

Cllrs Roger Dixcey, Lady Pigot

THAT the application be refused

Reasons: Due to the height and footprint of unit numbers 12 – 14 there would be an unacceptable impact in terms of scale and mass and proximity to number 18A Upton Road by virtue of the dominance of the block and the potential impact on the amenity of the property.

Due to the height and footprint of unit numbers 4, 5 and 6 there would be an unacceptable dominant impact on number 2 Southfield Gardens, particularly from the use of its external amenity space.

(Item 8)

Application: [TCP/00886/L](#)

Details: Pair of semi-detached houses with parking, (revised scheme)

Land at and rear of 25 and 27 High Street, Wootton Bridge, Ryde, Isle of Wight

Site Visits:	The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Monday, 24 March 2009.
Public Participants:	None.
Additional Representations:	Objections were received from Wootton Parish Council.
Comment:	The Local Member, Councillor Barry Abraham, spoke on this item.
Decision:	The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved: THAT the conditional permission be granted.
Conditions:	As per report (Item 13)

CHAIRMAN