



Minutes

Name of meeting	PLANNING COMMITTEE
Date and time	TUESDAY, 23 NOVEMBER 2010 COMMENCING AT 2.00 PM
Venue	COUNCIL CHAMBER, COUNTY HALL, NEWPORT, ISLE OF WIGHT
Present	Cllrs Ivan Bulwer (Chairman), Reg Barry, Roger Dixcey, Stuart Dyer, Paul Fuller, John Hobart, Richard Hollis, Julie Jones-Evans, David Knowles, Susan Scoccia, Arthur Taylor, Jerry White
Also Present (non-voting)	Cllrs George Brown, Edward Giles, David Whittaker
Officers Present	Russell Chick, Ben Gard, Peter Griffiths, Julie Martin, Bill Murphy, Phil Salmon, Peter Taylor, Andrew White, Sarah Wilkinson

23. [Minutes](#)

RESOLVED :

THAT the Minutes of the meeting held on [26 October 2010](#) be confirmed.

24. [Declarations of Interest](#)

Councillor Arthur Taylor declared a personal and prejudicial interest in Minute 26 (2 and 3) - Dairy Crest site, Newport, as his daughter lived in the area and was an objector to the application. He was not present during the discussion or voting thereon.

Councillor David Knowles declared a personal and prejudicial interest in Minute 26 (5) – Cameron House, 78 Pellhurst Road, Ryde, as he was the owner of a Care Home. He was not present during the discussion or voting thereon.

Councillor Jerry White declared a personal and prejudicial interest in Minute 26 (6) -18B Sandown Road, Lake, as he was the applicant. He was not present during the discussion or voting thereon.

25. [Public Question Time](#)

Ms Jackie Hawkins, Newport asked for an update of the trees that were felled at Petticoat Lane, Newport in March 2010.

The Head of Planning Services would provide a written response.

26. **Report of the Head of Planning Services**

Planning Applications and Related Matters

Consideration was given to items 1 - 6 of the report of the Head of Planning Services.

RESOLVED :

THAT the applications be determined as detailed below :

The reasons for the resolutions made in accordance with Officer recommendation were given in the Planning report. Where resolutions are made contrary to Officer recommendation the reasons for doing so are contained in the minutes.

A schedule of additional representations received after the printing of the report were submitted at the beginning of the meeting and were drawn to the attention of Members when considering the application. A note is made to that effect in the minutes.

Application: [TCP/30127](#)

Details: Application for modification of Planning Obligations made under TCP/18705/B/M/3873 and TCP/18705L/IW/P89895 seeking to increase the area to be retained as amenity land free from mobile homes while amending the maximum number of permissible mobile homes on site from 150 to 172 (revised layout)(readvertised application)

Medina Park, Folly Lane, East Cowes, Isle of Wight

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 19 November 2010.

Public Participants: Kathleen Sutton (Objector)

Additional Representations: The site owner had put forward a proposal that would involve increasing the number of mobile homes at the site to 160 with the intention of removing two proposed mobile home positions currently located within an area of open space. Given the Highways objection, the further increase would exacerbate the potential highways impact of the development. On that basis, Officers were of the opinion that no more than 158 mobile homes should be allowed, having assessed highways, landscape and amenity impacts.

The site owner had also proposed to retain approximately a sixth of the mobile homes as single units, to ensure a pool of more affordable units.

Formal comments from the Environment Agency were received in respect of the drainage system at the site. It had confirmed that it would have no objection to the additional mobile homes at the site, given the existing means of sewage disposal and the capacity available.

Comment: The Local Member, Cllr Edward Giles, spoke on this item.

Decision: The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

- (i) THAT the views of statutory consultees and the comments made by Officers be noted and the benefits of protecting the defined areas of open space, age controls and other provisions put forward be acknowledged.
- (ii) THAT a new legal agreement be entered into with the following clauses:
 - No more than 158 mobile homes to be placed within the approved areas of the site;
 - A site plan to be provided;
 - No mobile homes to be placed within the defined protected open spaces and buffer strips surrounding the site;
 - Occupation of mobile homes to be restricted to at least one person aged over 50 and the other being aged 18 or over;
 - No more than one car parking space to be allocated to each mobile home;
 - The compilation and upkeep of a register of occupants residing at the site;
 - No dogs to be kept at the site;
 - The distribution and display of information sheets/ packs relaying the ecological sensitivities of the site to residents;
 - Provision of landscaping in accordance with details to be agreed with the Local Planning Authority
 - The two units to be removed from the copse and only five units be allowed in the meadow;
 - Hedges and tress to be well maintained and protected;

Conditions: As per report (Item 1)

(Councillor Arthur Taylor declared a personal and prejudicial interest in the following two items and left the room).

Application: [TCP/00502/Z](#)

Details: Residential development comprising 60 dwellings with landscaping and associated network of roads/infrastructure; access link with Foxes Road (revised plans) (readvertised application)

Land at former Dairy Crest Site, between Westminster Lane and, Petticoat Lane, Newport, Isle of Wight

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 24 September 2010.

Comment: There was some discussion as to whether part of the money raised through the S106 Agreement could be used to reinvest in the pavements along Mill Street and the general vicinity of the site to make them fit for purpose.

Decision: The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

THAT the application be approved.

Conditions: As per report (Item 2)

Application: [TCP/29980](#)

Details: Outline for three/four storey block to provide 58 assisted living apartments with undercroft parking; landscaping; vehicular access off Mill Street (revised plans)(readvertised application)

Land at former Dairy Crest site, north of Lukely Brook, Westminster Lane, Newport, Isle of Wight

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 24 September 2010.

Comment: There was some discussion as to whether part of the money raised through the S106 Agreement could be used to reinvest in the pavements along Mill Street and the general vicinity of the site to make them fit for purpose.

Public Participants: Keith Chichester (Agent)

Additional Representations: A condition had been omitted from the report.

Decision: The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

THAT the application be approved

Conditions: 26. The building hereby approved shall provide for a range of heights as indicated on plan, drawing number GO1-1805-06 Rev. A, with no more than six flats and essential common areas including stairwells being provided at second floor level.

Reason: To ensure that the height and overall scale of the development is sympathetic to the general character and appearance of the surrounding area and to comply with Policy D1 (Standards of Design) of the Isle of Wight Unitary Development Plan.

As per report (Item 3)

(Councillor Arthur Taylor returned to the room)

(Councillor David Knowles declared a personal and prejudicial interest in this item and left the room).

(During the debate Councillor Julie Jones-Evans declared a personal interest as she knew one of the neighbours)

Application: [TCP/01644/N](#)

Details: Alterations; single storey extension to provide additional bedrooms; relocation of conservatory (revised scheme)

Cameron House, 78 Pellhurst Road, Ryde, Isle of Wight

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 19 November 2010.

Public Participants: Mr Brade (Objector)
Mr Glen Hepburn (Agent)

Decision: The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

THAT the application be refused.

Conditions: As per report (Item 5)

(Councillor David Knowles returned to the room)

(Cllr Jerry White declared a personal and prejudicial interest in this item and left the room).

Application: [TCP/28681/B](#)

Details: Alterations and change of use from retail/commercial to residential (revised site outline)(readvertised application)
18B Sandown Road, Lake, Isle of Wight

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 19 November 2010.

Public Participants: Mr Martin Hayles (Agent)

Decision: The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

THAT the application be approved.

Conditions: As per report (Item 6)

(Councillor Jerry White returned to the room)

Application: [TCP/27465/F](#)

Details: Residential development comprising 180 dwellings (phase 2 of East Cowes Project - plots 6D/1A, B, C and D), public open spaces, landscaping, internal road lay-out, parking and woodland areas (aorm)

Land south of Old Road, and west of, Sylvan Avenue, East Cowes, Isle of Wight

Site Visits: A further site visit was undertaken by the Planning Committee on Friday, 19 November 2010 in order for members to appreciate any highway implications.

Additional Representations: One additional letter of objection had been received from a local resident.

Comment: A statement from the Local Member, Councillor Edward Giles, was read out.

Decision: The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

THAT the application be approved.

Conditions: As per report (Item 4)

The meeting then adjourned and reconvened on Thursday, 25 November 2010 in the Council Chamber, County Hall, Newport, Isle of Wight, commencing at 4.00 pm.

Present Cllrs Ivan Bulwer (Chairman), Reg Barry, Stuart Dyer, Paul Fuller
Richard Hollis, Julie Jones-Evans, David Knowles,
Susan Scoccia, Arthur Taylor, Jerry White

Also Present Cllrs George Brown, John Howe, Andy Sutton, Chris Welsford
(non voting)

Officers Present Ben Gard, Roy Little, Julie Martin, Phil Salmon, Alan White,
Sarah Wilkinson, Steve Wiltshire

Apologies Cllrs Roger Dixcey, John Hobart

27. **Declarations of Interest**

Councillor Susan Scoccia declared a personal interest in Minute 28 (7) – 1 Church Street, Ventnor, as she knew one of the objectors.

Councillor Stuart Dyer declared a personal interest in Minute 28 (8) – Little Orchard, Elliston Road, Totland Bay, as he knew the person speaking on behalf of Totland Parish Council.

28. **Report of the Head of Planning Services**

(a) **Planning Applications and Related Matters**

Consideration was given to items 7 - 10 of the report of the Head of Planning Services.

RESOLVED :

THAT the applications be determined as detailed below :

The reasons for the resolutions made in accordance with Officer recommendation were given in the Planning report. Where resolutions are made contrary to Officer recommendation the reasons for doing so are contained in the minutes.

A schedule of additional representations received after the printing of the report were submitted at the beginning of the meeting and were drawn to the attention of Members when considering the application. A note is made to that effect in the minutes.

Application: [TCP/26521/A](#)

Details: Proposed change of use from retail (A1) to estate agency (A2)

1 Church Street, Ventnor, Isle of Wight

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 19 November 2010.

Public Participants: Sheila Thompson (Objector)
Linda Chester (Objector)
Mr Martin Hayles (Agent)

Comment: The Local Member, Cllr Chris Welsford, spoke on this item.

Decision: The application was refused contrary to officer recommendation as members believed there would be an unacceptable impact on the viability of the commercial centre of Ventnor

In compliance with the Council's Constitution a named vote was taken as the decision was contrary to officer recommendation.

For (6)

Cllrs Reg Barry, Paul Fuller, Richard Hollis, Julie Jones-Evans, David Knowles, Susan Scoccia,

Against (4)

Cllrs Ivan Bulwer, Stuart Dyer, Arthur Taylor, Jerry White

RESOLVED:

THAT the application be refused.

Reasons: The impact on viability of the commercial centre of Ventnor.
Inappropriate use of the building as it was designed to be a shop.
Unacceptable impact on tourism in Ventnor.
(Item 7)

Application: [TCP/04262/H](#)

Details: Demolition of bungalow; construction of two/three storey block of ten retirement apartments; bin store; parking and associated landscaping; relocation of vehicular access

Little Orchard, Elliston Road, Totland Bay, Isle of Wight

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 19 November 2010.

Public Participants: Carol Bryan (On behalf of Totland Parish Council)
Mr Paul Stack (Agent)

Comment: The Local Member, Cllr John Howe, spoke on this item.

Decision: The application was refused contrary to officer recommendation as members believed it was contrary to PPS 1 and PPS 3, in relation to the loss of greenspace within the streetscene, as well as its overbearing impact on the amenities of the occupiers of Elliston House.

In compliance with the Council's Constitution a named vote was taken as the decision was contrary to officer recommendation.

For (7)

Cllrs Stuart Dyer, Paul Fuller, Richard Hollis, Julie Jones-Evans, David Knowles, Susan Scoccia, Jerry White

Against (3)

Cllrs Reg Barry, Ivan Bulwer, Arthur Taylor

RESOLVED:

THAT the application be refused.

Reasons: Contrary to Government guidance in PPS 1 and PPS 3 in terms of the loss of greenspace.

The proposal failed to overcome the Inspector's concerns with regard to the impact of the development on the neighbouring property.

(Item 8)

Application: [TCP/29728/A](#)

Details: Demolition of building; construction of holiday complex comprising nine chalets, indoor swimming pool, tennis court, reception/bar building, bin and cycle store, parking and associated works

The Brambles Centre, Monks Lane, Freshwater, Isle of Wight

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 19 November 2010.

Public Participants: Mr Nick Hawkins (Objector)
Mr Colin Lillywhite (On behalf of Freshwater Parish Council)

Additional Representations: 2 further letters were received.

Following the publication of the agenda, the Local Planning Authority had received the Inspector's decision on an appeal into the refusal of planning permission for application P/00910/09 (11 holiday cottages, detached building to provide swimming pool / gym / sauna, tennis court, parking and bin store) on the application site.

The Inspector's decision, dated 19 November 2010, dismissed the application. Paragraphs 8 and 9 of the decision set out the main grounds for dismissal.

Comment: The Local Member, Cllr Andy Sutton, spoke on this item.

Decision: The application was refused contrary to officer recommendation as members believed that the inspector's views with regard to the compatibility of the development with the surrounding properties had not been satisfied.

In compliance with the Council's Constitution a named vote was taken as the decision was contrary to officer recommendation.

For (5)

Cllrs Ivan Bulwer, Stuart Dyer, Paul Fuller, Richard Hollis, Jerry White

Against (4)

Cllrs Reg Barry, David Knowles, Susan Scoccia, Arthur Taylor

RESOLVED:

THAT the application be refused.

Reasons: The Inspector's views on planning application P/00910/09 with regard to the surrounding properties in terms of height, scale and design had not been satisfied.

(Item 9)

Application: [TCP/29834/E](#)

Details: Retention and completion of three temporary show homes and one show flat and sales office with associated seating area, landscaping water feature and parking area (amended description)(readadvertised application)

Land to the south east of Newport, between and including part of Staplers Road and, St. Georges Way, Newport, Isle of Wight

Site Visits: The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 19 November 2010.

Public Participants: Mr Chris Hougham (On behalf of Newport Parish Council)
Mr James Dunne (Agent)

Additional Representations: For clarity, the application referred to in paragraph 3.2 of the report was to be determined through the delegated procedures process.

An additional condition was recommended in order to ensure that the materials used in the construction of the proposed developed were recycled and re-used where appropriate.

Comment: Cllr Roger Mazillius the Cabinet Member with responsibility for housing spoke on this item.

Decision: The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

THAT the application be approved.

Conditions: An additional condition to be added as follows :

3. Prior to the demolition of the units hereby approved a Site Waste Management Strategy shall be submitted to and agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority. The Strategy shall include details of how the materials used in the construction of the building shall be re-used.

Reason: In the interest of sustainable development and to accord with Planning Policy Statement 1: Delivering Sustainable Development

As per report (Item 10)

(b) **[Schedule of Planning Appeals as at 31 October 2010.](#)**

Members considered the report of the schedule of planning appeals as at 31 December 2010.

The Committee was given a summary of statistics and advised that of the appeals considered by the inspector 46% had been dismissed and 54% allowed. It was noted there was a backlog of appeals with the planning inspectorate.

RESOLVED :

THAT the report be noted.

CHAIRMAN