



# Minutes

Name of meeting	<b>PLANNING COMMITTEE</b>
Date and time	<b>TUESDAY, 21 JULY 2009 COMMENCING AT 4.00 PM</b>
Venue	<b>COUNCIL CHAMBER, COUNTY HALL, NEWPORT, ISLE OF WIGHT</b>
Present	Cllrs Ivan Bulwer (Chairman), George Cameron, Roger Dixcey, Stuart Dyer, Paul Fuller, John Hobart, Richard Hollis, Julie Jones-Evans, Susan Scoccia, Adrian Whittaker, David Whittaker
Also Present (non voting)	Cllrs Barry Abraham, George Brown, Vanessa Churchman, David Pugh
Officers Present	Bill Murphy, Phil Salmon, Justin Thorne, Gavin Toogood, Andrew White, Simon Wiggins, Sarah Wilkinson

---

5. [Minutes](#)

RESOLVED :

THAT the Minutes of the meeting held on [23 June 2009](#) be confirmed.

6. [Declarations of Interest](#)

Councillor Adrian Whittaker declared a personal interest in Minute 7 (1) – Land between Node Close and Rotary Court and north of Southfield Gardens, Ryde, as the application had previously been discussed by Ryde Town Council, of which he was a member.

[Councillor Paul Fuller](#) declared a personal interest in Minute 7 (2) – Rookstone Cottage, Egypt Hill, Cowes, as Mr David Jones of Cowes Town Council was known by them.

Councillor Paul Fuller declared a personal interest in Minute 7 (5) – Woodvale Inn, 1 Princes Esplanade, Cowes, as he was a member of Gurnard Parish Council.

Councillor John Hobart declared a personal and prejudicial interest in Minute 7 (5) – Woodvale Inn, 1 Princes Esplanade, Cowes, as he had previous involvement with the application as the previous ward member. He was not present during the discussion or voting thereon.

Councillor Roger Dixcey declared a personal interest in Minute 7 (7) – Copse Lodge, Youngwoods Way, Alverstone Garden Village, Sandown, as he had previously worked for the applicant.

## 7. Report of the Head of Planning Services

### Planning Applications and Related Matters

Consideration was given to items 1 - 7 of the report of the Head of Planning Services.

#### RESOLVED :

THAT the applications be determined as detailed below:

The reasons for the resolutions made in accordance with Officer recommendation were given in the Planning report. Where resolutions are made contrary to Officer recommendation the reasons for doing so are contained in the minutes.

A schedule of additional representations received after the printing of the report were submitted at the beginning of the meeting and were drawn to the attention of Members when considering the application. A note is made to that effect in the minutes.

**Application:** [TCP/26116/E](#)

**Details:** Demolition of east wing (18 Upton Road) of Southfield: residential development of 14 houses with parking and vehicular access (aorm) (revised plans).

Land between Node Close and Rotary Court and north of Southfield Gardens, Ryde, Isle of Wight.

**Site Visits:** The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 17 July 2009.

**Public** Mr Steve Haines (Applicant)

**Participants:** Mr Calvin Barnes (Applicant)

Mr Tindell (Objector)

Cllr Tim Wakely (On behalf of Ryde Town Council)

**Additional Representations:** One letter from the Nodes Close Residents Association, which commented on the application and had been dismissed at Appeal highlighted the following points:

- Concern regarding the bulk and massing of the proposed buildings.
- The current application did not address the issues raised by the Inspector in respect of landscaping, coupled with the design and bulk of the buildings.

Three letters of comment had been received from Third Parties regarding the revised plans, which had been put out to local consultation. The letters raised the following points:

- The proposals still represented an over-development of the site.
- The previous comments were still relevant.
- Raised concern regarding the validity of the original outline consent.
- The parking proposed was unacceptable and unrealistic and likely to cause on street parking issues.
- The development remained out of character.
- The style and density of the development was inappropriate.

It was the Officers view that these points had been adequately assessed within the report and on that basis they had no additional comment to make.

**Comment:** The Local Member, Cllr Vanessa Churchman, spoke on this item.

**Amendments:** It was noted on page 13, paragraph 6.3.1 of the report made an incorrect reference to a bungalow, which was no longer an element of the application.

**Decision:** The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

THAT the application be approved.

**Conditions:** As per report (Item 1)

---

**Application:** [TCP/14354/B](#)

**Details:** Demolition of dwelling; replacement dwelling with parking/turning area.

Rookstone Cottage, Egypt Hill, Cowes, Isle of Wight.

**Site Visits:** The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 17 July 2009.

**Public Participants:** Mr David Jones (On behalf of Cowes Town Council)

**Additional Representations:** One additional third party letter from a neighbouring property had been received, which reiterated their previous objections to the scheme. In summary these were, that the replacement dwelling was too large, the design inappropriate for the area and that it would have an adverse impact to the occupiers of neighbouring properties.

**Comment:** The Committee considered the reasons for the recommendation and raised further concern in regard to the design, scale and mass of the proposal. They further raised concern in regard to light spillage from the design onto neighbouring properties.

In compliance with the Council's Constitution the local member, Cllr Paul Fuller, did not vote.

**Decision:** The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

THAT the application be refused

**Reasons:** As per report, but with the following amendments :

- (1) 2<sup>nd</sup> line – after the word site insert ‘which combined with the contemporary design solution would result’.
- (2) 2<sup>nd</sup> line – after the word nature insert ‘and a design which would lead to unacceptable light spillage’.

(Item 2)

---

**Application:** TCP/12953/G

**Details:** Continued use of property as house as multiple occupancy.

42 Fitzroy Street, Sandown, Isle of Wight.

**This application was withdrawn prior to the meeting at the request of the Agent.**

(Item 3)

---

**Application:** [TCP/06579/D](#)

**Details:** Demolition of car port; chalet bungalow (revised scheme) (revised site area) (readvertised application).

Land adjacent 92, Palmers Road, Wootton Bridge, Ryde, Isle of Wight.

**Site Visits:** The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 17 July 2009.

**Public** Mr David Long (On behalf of applicant)

**Participants:** Mr Cool (Objector)

**Additional** None  
**Representations:**

**Comment:** The Local Member, Cllr Barry Abraham, spoke on this item.

**Amendments:** It was noted on Page 51, paragraph 6.5.2 incorrectly referred to a garage, which was no longer an element of the application.

**Decision:** The application was refused contrary to officer recommendation.

In compliance with the Council’s Constitution a named vote was taken as the decision was contrary to officer recommendation.

## For (11)

Cllrs Ivan Bulwer, George Cameron, Roger Dixcey, Stuart Dyer, Paul Fuller, John Hobart, Richard Hollis, Julie Jones-Evans, Susan Scoccia, Adrian Whittaker, David Whittaker.

**Reasons:** The application was refused for the following reasons:  
The dwelling as proposed would constitute overdevelopment of the site by reason of the narrow plot width, in combination with the Scale, Mass and Siting of the proposed dwelling. It would further result in the potential loss of vegetation along the boundary with Queens Road and be an unsympathetic addition which would be detrimental to the character of the street scene.  
(Item 4)

---

(Councillor John Hobart declared a personal and prejudicial interest in this item and left the room).

**Application:** [TCP/15722/L](#)

**Details:** Alterations; enclosure of first floor decking area to provide extended dining facilities.

Woodvale Inn, 1 Princes Esplanade, Cowes, Isle of Wight.

**Site Visits:** The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 17 July 2009.

**Public Participants:** Mr Martin Hayles (Agent)

**Additional Representations:** None

**Comment:** In compliance with the Council's Constitution the local member, Cllr Paul Fuller, did not vote.

**Amendments:** It was noted on Page 60; paragraph 5.3 incorrectly referred to Cowes Town Council and should read Gurnard Parish Council.

**Decision:** The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

THAT the application be refused.

**Reasons:** As per report (Item 5)

---

**Application:** [TCP/01933/H](#)

**Details:** Proposed end of terrace house; vehicular access and parking (revised scheme).

30 Queens Road, Shanklin, Isle of Wight.

**Site Visits:** The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on

Friday, 17 July 2009.

**Public Participants:** Mrs S Radford (Objector)

**Additional Representations:** None

**Comment:** The Local Member, Cllr David Pugh, spoke on this item.

**Amendments:** It was noted on Page 66; paragraph 4.3.1 incorrectly referred to Fishbourne and should read Shanklin.

**Decision:** The application was refused contrary to officer recommendation.

In compliance with the Council's Constitution a named vote was taken as the decision was contrary to officer recommendation.

**For (10)**

Cllrs George Cameron, Roger Dixcey, Stuart Dyer, Paul Fuller, John Hobart, Richard Hollis, Julie Jones-Evans, Susan Scoccia, Adrian Whittaker, David Whittaker.

**Against (1)**

Cllr Ivan Bulwer.

**Reasons:** The application was refused for the following reasons:

The proposed development in combination with the existing building would, by reason of its excessive scale, mass and overall bulk, particularly in respect of the rear elevation, result in an overbearing and un-neighbourly addition. It would have a detrimental affect to the amenities of neighbouring property occupiers and in addition be out of contrast with the surrounding area.

In consequence, the proposal was contrary to policies G4 and D1 of the Unitary Development Plan.

(Item 6)

---

**Application:** [TCP/29513/A](#)

**Details:** Proposed detached garage and boundary wall (revised plans).

Copse Lodge, Youngwoods Way, Alverstone Garden Village, Sandown, Isle of Wight.

**Site Visits:** The site was visited by members of the Planning Committee on Friday, 17 July 2009.

**Public Participants:** Mr Chris Hougham (Agent)

**Additional** None

**Representations:**

**Comment:** None

**Decision:** The Committee had taken into consideration and agreed with the reasons for the recommendation as set out under paragraph entitled Justification for Recommendation of the report and resolved:

(i) THAT the boundary wall be conditionally approved.

(ii) THAT the proposed detached garage be refused.

**Reasons:** As per report (Item 7)

---

8. **Members' Question Time**

Cllr David Whittaker asked a question in relation to an update with regard to Section 106 Agreements.

Cllr Julie Jones-Evans asked a question in relation to an agreed protocol in regard to interaction with agents during site visits. A reply was given.

Cllr Susan Scoccia asked a question in relation to the new framework within the Planning Department. A reply was given.

CHAIRMAN